

“Creating Spaces to Take Action on Violence Against Women and Girls”

Oxfam India

Final Review Report

Submitted by: Kaarak Enterprise Development Services Private Limited, New Delhi

July 2021

Table of Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	13
<i>Background.....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>About the Final Review.....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Methodology.....</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Methodological Steps.....</i>	<i>15</i>
CHAPTER 2: ABOUT THE CREATING SPACES PROJECT	18
<i>Coverage.....</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Project Design.....</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Project Strategies.....</i>	<i>19</i>
CHAPTER 3: KEY FINDINGS	21
RELEVANCE	21
<i>Relevance to the demographic and social context.....</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>Relevance to the context of VAWG and CEFM in India and the project areas</i>	<i>22</i>
<i>Relevance to the context of legal and support Services</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Relevance of the project for youth and adolescents as compared to adults.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Relevance of engagement with the Influencers.....</i>	<i>24</i>
COHERENCE	24
<i>Coherence with the government laws and initiatives</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Coherence with the not-for-profit and private sector.....</i>	<i>25</i>
EFFECTIVENESS.....	25
PILLAR 1: ENGAGING COMMUNITY ACTORS TO SUPPORT AND PROMOTE GENDER NORMS	25
<i>Strategies</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1100</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1110</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1120</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1130</i>	<i>36</i>
PILLAR 2: SUPPORTING WOMEN AND GIRLS WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED VIOLENCE.....	39
<i>Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1200</i>	<i>40</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1210</i>	<i>41</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1220</i>	<i>42</i>
PILLAR 3: BUILDING KNOWLEDGE AND CAPACITY OF INSTITUTIONS AND ALLIANCES TO INFLUENCE CHANGE.....	43
<i>Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1300</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1310</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1320</i>	<i>47</i>
<i>Progress of Immediate Outcome 1330</i>	<i>48</i>
COVID IMPACT.....	49
IMPACT	50
<i>Impact at the Individual Level.....</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>Impact at the Relational Level.....</i>	<i>51</i>
<i>Impact at the Community Level.....</i>	<i>52</i>
SUSTAINABILITY	52

<i>Community level sustainability factors</i>	<i>52</i>
<i>Partner level sustainability factors.....</i>	<i>53</i>
<i>Sustainability strategies that have future potential and need strengthening.....</i>	<i>53</i>
CHAPTER 4: LESSONS LEARNED	54
CHAPTER 5: RECOMMENDATIONS	56
ANNEXURE 1: SUMMARY OF THE PEER LEARNING EXERCISE	57

Executive Summary

Creating Spaces to Take Action on Violence Against Women and Girls (Creating Spaces, CS) is a five-year project (2016-2021), supported by Global Affairs Canada (GAC) and Oxfam Canada. The project takes action to reduce violence against women and girls (VAWG), including child, early and forced marriage (CEFM) in six countries across Asia including India. In India, Creating Spaces is being implemented in five states of Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Odisha and Uttar Pradesh.

The project is divided into three main pillars, and the project outcomes are distributed across these pillars. The table below describes the theory of change of the project. **Pillar 1** focuses on **prevention of VAWG and CEFM** by capacitating community level influencers and capacitating the community to identify and address root causes of gender violence. **Pillar 2** focuses on **response to VAWG and CEFM** through the provision or referral to support services and livelihood opportunities. **Pillar 3** focuses on **sustainability of the project** by equipping local organizations and alliances long-lasting knowledge, capacity and tools.

Reduce violence against women and girls and child, early and forced marriage in Bangladesh, India, Indonesia, Nepal, Pakistan and Philippines		
PILLAR ONE: Engaging key community actors to support and promote positive gender norms	PILLAR TWO: Supporting women and girls who have experienced violence	PILLAR THREE: Building knowledge and capacity of institutions and alliances to influence change
Intermediate Outcomes		
Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector and political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights, and in reducing violence against women and girls	Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and child, early and forced marriage	Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems to end violence against women and girls
Immediate Outcomes		
(1110): Increased knowledge, skills and capacity of Influencers to enact and implement laws, policies and accountability mechanisms to reduce VAWG and the prevalence of CEFM	(1210): Increased ability of women and girls who have experienced VAWG and CEFM to access quality shelters, legal and psycho-social support services	(1310): Improved VAWG and CEFM prevention and response knowledge generation, learning and dissemination
(1120): Improved positive attitudes and behaviour modelled by Influencers and Youth in support of social norms to prevent VAWG and CEFM	(1220): Increased economic skills and knowledge among women and girls who have experience violence	(1320): Improved country and regional linkages, alliances and relationships on issues of VAWG and CEFM
(1130) Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM		(1330): Increased capacity of partner CSOs and WROs to deliver effective, transparent and accountable programs that contribute to reducing VAWG and prevalence of CEFM

Objectives and Methodology of the Final Review

Kaarak, as in-country consultant supported the international consultant in final review of the CS project. And also developed this in-country review report. This report assesses the performance of the project in India.

The overall objective of the final review is to ***capture lessons learnt and to build on project's experiences and help Oxfam to understand how decisions made during the project can be used to implement successful VAWG projects in the future.***

The **specific objectives** are to:

- Provide an independent assessment of the project, including strengths and weaknesses.
- Assess how findings and recommendations from the MTLR impacted the program
- Identify discrepancies, if any, between Creating Spaces' initial assumptions and actual occurrences.
- Establish progression on targets (intermediate to immediate and immediate to ultimate).
- Indicate adjustments and changes relevant to potential future projects.
- Capture lessons learned and provide recommendations to enhance EVAWG programming.

The final review used ***a mixed-method approach*** using both quantitative and qualitative primary data as well as secondary data. The quantitative survey covered two types of respondents – (a) women and girl beneficiaries of the project, and (b) the influencers. A total sample of 368 was covered including 186 influencers and 182 women/ girls. In addition, qualitative interactions were held with different community members- women, men and adolescents/ youth, and with the project partners.

Key Findings

Relevance

India ranks 140th among 156 countries in the World Economic Forum's Global Gender Gap Report (2021), with more than 1 in 4 women facing intimate partner violence in her lifetime. In fact, the five project states are among the eight poorest states in the country scoring low on social and gender equality indicators such as sex ratio, child sex ratio, literacy rate for men and women, percentage in employment, and rate of VAWG and CEFM. Thus the project's ToC ***served a critical gap area in the country and the state, and was aligned to the contextual needs at the national and state levels.*** The baseline study undertaken at the start of the program further attests to the relevance of the project with the high incidence of early marriage and normalization of various forms of domestic violence (DV) in the target areas. Despite the provision of various policies and laws to address VAWG and CEFM- notably the Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act 2005 (PWDVA) and the Prohibition of Child Marriage Act, 2006 (PCMA)- there is significant gaps in their implementation and lack of clarity on their provisions.

The project's strategy to engage with youth and influencers was also highly relevant to the context of the target locations. India is one of the youngest country of the world and the youth show eagerness and motivation to question and change social norms. Yet very few initiatives engage them, and there is absence of representation and voice given to the youth. Rural communities in India are generally in the grips of formal and informal influencers who wield enormous power in the area. For the success of the project, it was thus essential to engage with both these traditional influencers (who have the power to change the mindset/ practices of the community) and the youth (who have capacity and willingness to change the mindset/ practices of the community).

Coherence

The project mapped and aligned itself with both government and non-government initiatives and campaigns against VAWG and CEFM. This ensured synergy of project activities, helped in advocacy efforts, filled policy gaps and ensured sustainability of project outcomes.

It was aligned with various state and national level laws such as: PWDVA and PCMA (mentioned above); the Immoral Traffic Prevention Act, 1956 (ITPA); Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act (POCSO Act) 2012; and the Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013. The project was also aligned with various state level schemes and institutions such as: *Beti Bachao Beti Padhao* program, the One Stop Centers in Chhattisgarh and Odisha, the Mahila Samakhya and Sahyogini in

Uttar Pradesh, Center for Women Studies in Chhattisgarh, Utkal University in Odisha, and the various skill development and rural development programs in different states.

The project also project identified and established linkages/ alliances with major non-for-project sector actors including civil society organisations (CSO) and their network and their alliances working to reduce VAWG and CEFM at the state and national levels.

Effectiveness

The project has successfully reached or exceeded most of the targets set against the indicators of the three pillars; in a few cases, it is well on its way to completing them by the sixth year. When comparing the project's performance under the three pillars, the review found that the project was most effective in its Pillar 1 strategies, comparatively less effective in its Pillar 2 strategies and moderately effective in its Pillar 3 strategies. The table below gives a brief overview of the project's performance against the intermediate outcome indicators of the three pillars.

Table 1: Project's performance against the intermediate outcome indicators for the three pillars

Pillar	Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
Pillar 1: Engaging key community actors to support and promote positive gender norms	ITO 1100 Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector and political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights and in reducing violence against women and girls.	1100.1 Number of public declarations and actions by influencers to end VAWG, and CEFM, and in support of women's rights and leadership	0	8	18
		1100.2 Perspectives of beneficiaries on VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership	0.57	0.74	1.58
Pillar 2: Supporting women and girls who have experienced violence	ITO 1200 Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and child, early and forced marriage	1200.1 Percentage of women and girls who have experienced violence accessing quality support services ¹ , by country	14%*	40%	53.8%
		1200.2 Percentage of women and girls reporting satisfaction with the quality of support services	32%*	100%*	85.7%
		1200.3 Percentage of women and girls accessing economic opportunities	3%	16%	25.8%
Pillar 3: Building knowledge and capacity of institutions and alliances to influence change	ITO 1300 Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems to end violence against women and girls	1300.1 Percentage of partners who use best practices to improve linkages to address VAWG and CEFM	0		100%
		1300.2 Percentage of partner organizations reporting on improvement on their ICRW/CAT	0		100%

¹ The definition of quality support services was never provided; thus, these may have been more limited at baseline.

		organizational capacity score			
--	--	-------------------------------	--	--	--

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

- **Effectiveness of Pillar 1 Strategy:** The strategies adopted under this pillar included: forming collectives; developing formal curriculum for knowledge transfer in the collectives; use of community score cards to help the collectives and influencers assess progress on project outcomes and the community's access to public services; use of interactive participatory platforms for awareness raising (like fairs and rallies); identifying and engaging with influencers; engaging with youth and use of film appreciation model. The use of these strategies was effective in improving the understanding, skills and capacities of influencers, particularly of youth and improved engagement of youth. For other traditional influencers, however, while their support and enthusiasm for the project increased over the implementation period, their engagement in bringing critical change in the community show mixed findings - with instances of influencers taking proactive steps to address CEFM and VAWG in the community to those of influencers denying incidences of gender based discrimination and violence. Most influencers demonstrate the capacity and inclination to take action within the community (often through informal channels) against incidences of VAWG. At the level of the community, the project has been effective in changing perceptions and increasing understanding and knowledge of the community members with regard to CEFM and VAWG. The community's understanding on what constitutes as VAWG has expanded, and their knowledge about the legislations around it has increased. The community, especially young girls, have started valuing continuation of girls' education over early marriage and there have been many initiatives taken by individuals, collectives and caste groups to intervene and stop incidences of child marriage. For VAWG and DV, any intervention by the community is generally more informal in nature, but there is greater sensitization around it, and women and girls express greater confidence and capacity to raise their voice against such incidences.

What has been most successful under this pillar one has been (a) identifying motivated youth and adolescent boys and girls and training them using the ToTs; (b) connective women's and girls' collectives with relevant authorities/ influencers; (c) centering leadership and empowerment of women/ girls in all activities; (d) contextualizing DV and CEFM within the local contexts and inter-connected issues (such as unemployment or alcoholism). Where **the project has fallen short** under Pillar 1 has been in (a) addressing deep rooted gender bias or social norms, particularly of some of the older influencers; (b) failing to address the intersection of gender with caste and minority issues and thus not being able to reach the most marginalized in many locations (such as the Muslim population in Uttar Pradesh).

Table 2: Project's performance against the Immediate Outcomes under Pillar 1

Immediate Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO-(1110): Increased knowledge, skills and capacity of Influencers to enact and implement laws, policies and accountability mechanisms to reduce VAWG and the prevalence of CEFM	1110.1 Percentage of influencers reporting improved knowledge and skills to influence laws		83%*	89.0%
	1110.2 Number of formal/informal accountability initiatives strengthened	0	8	15
IMO- (1120): Improved positive attitudes and behaviour modelled by Influencers and Youth in support of social norms to prevent VAWG and CEFM	1120.1 Percentage of influencers reporting improved understanding of the rights and entitlements of girls		72%*	53.9% (all 10 answers correct) 94.5 % (8 or more correct answers)

	1120.2 Percentage of influencers who can identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM		95%*	53.9%
IMO- (1130) Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM	1130.1 Percentage of women and girl leaders reporting improved understanding of VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership			26.8% (all 9 answers correct) 77.0 % (7 or more correct answers)
	1130.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of women and girl leaders on their capacity to advocate to end VAWG and CEFM			4.17

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

- **Effectiveness of Pillar 2 Strategy:** Under this pillar, the project used four main strategies- (a) implementing women support centres in Odisha and Chhattisgarh and connecting survivors of VAWG to existing support services in the other states; (b) building capacity of service providers on their role in implementing different VAWG services; (c) linking women and girls to income generation opportunities; (d) building capacity of community level influencers on women's economic rights. The activities under this pillar was most ambitious, and the review finds that in comparison to the other pillars, it has been least successful in implementing them. This is mainly due to the absence of quality support services or livelihood opportunities in the target areas, the disruption caused due to COVID-19 related lockdown, lack of adequate funds or time to create sustained linkages for support, livelihood and relief for the women and girls facing violence. However, the project did meet its targets set under this pillar and was able to create sustained capacities at the individual and community levels for survivors of VAWG to access income generation and support services. The project was able to capacitate the survivors with information on their rights and entitlements, on the laws and services available, with skills for income generation and information on how to undertake these income generation activities. It also created a favourable environment for the women and girls to access support services and livelihood opportunities due to the better sensitized and trained service providers and community influencers.

As a result women and girls show increased confidence and ability to access support services and livelihood opportunities; but their actual access to them is very low and only on case-by-case basis, not in a sustained manner.

Table 3: Project's performance against the Immediate Outcomes under Pillar 2

Immediate Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1210): Increased ability of women and girls who have experienced VAWG and CEFM to access quality shelters, legal and psycho-social support services	1210.1 Percentage of women and girls reached reporting increased awareness of their rights and ability to access support services	No baseline	77%*	81.8%
IMO- (1220): Increased economic skills and knowledge	1220.1 Percentage of women and girls reporting increased skills, knowledge and	No baseline	85%*	56.9%

among women and girls who have experience violence	confidence to participate in economic activities			
	1220.2 Percentage of women and girls who report on positive support from family to participate in economic activities	No baseline	94%*	97.9%

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

- **Effectiveness of Pillar 3 Strategy:** Under this pillar, the program prioritised building strength and capacity of the partners and their alliances to ensure sustainability of project's outcomes. The program used innovative ways to build accountability and capacity of the partners to use evidence based advocacy and to create and empower alliances to carry forward the work started by this program. Some of the key strategies under this pillar included the use of innovative tools like the peer learning exercise (PLE) as a participatory mid-term review exercise, formation of alliances for advocacy and creation of various knowledge products (such as research reports and policy briefs) and research tools. A key component of this pillar was also the development and use of the Capacity Assessment Tool (CAT). The partners were trained to use these to develop their action plans, track their progress, and improve their accountability systems. These methods have been effective in increasing the capacity of partners and women/ girl leaders to undertake research driven planning and advocacy. The partners report improvement on their CAT score and the find the use of CAT new and useful in improving their programming.

Table 4: Project's performance against the Immediate Outcomes under Pillar 3

Immediate Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1310): Improved VAWG and CEFM prevention and response knowledge generation, learning and dissemination	1310. 1 Number of initiatives undertaken by beneficiaries using evidence based research	0		8
	1320.1 Number of strategic alliances formed or strengthened on addressing VAWG and CEFM	0		13
IMO- (1320): Improved country and regional linkages, alliances and relationships on issues of VAWG and CEFM	1320.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of partners and influencers on their engagement with strategic alliances	0		3
	1330.1 Percentage of partner organizations that have adopted the recommended action plan based on their ICRW/CAT	0		100%
IMO- (1330): Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM	1330.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of partners on the effectiveness of CAT to improve their VAWG/CEFM related programming	0		4.5

- **Impact of COVID:** The pandemic and the ensuing lockdown have disrupted many of the project activities-regular sessions of the collectives were discontinued and many of the face-to-face activities had be put on

hold which may have implications on the effectiveness and impact of the project. On the other hand, partner organizations shifted their focus on providing COVID/ lockdown related relief to the communities and some of the collectives organized meetings on their own to address COVID related challenges faced by the community. Youth collective members and influencers also took proactive steps to facilitate access of community to social entitlements, including VAWG services.

The lockdown also increased financial constraints and overcrowding in the homes increasing tensions and in some cases increasing VAWG, reversing some of the progress made by the project. This was particularly the case in Uttar Pradesh where 72% of the community respondents reported increase in VAWG since the pandemic. In other location however, especially in Odisha and Chhattisgarh, the community members also report reduction in VAWG- this is mainly due to the lack of access to alcohol during the pandemic.

Impact

- **Impact at the *Individual level*:** The project has had significant impact on the community members' understanding of gender, gender discrimination, different forms of VAWG (i.e., beyond solely physical violence), CEFM and how these are linked with deep rooted patriarchal systems. It is unclear if this increased understanding has translated into reduction of DV or VAWG, but it has given the women and girls the ability and confidence to recognize when violence is done to them and to raise their voice against it if it happens. One of the most significant impact has been in girls demanding to delay their marriage or to continue their education. Parents and community members are also showing greater inclination to respect these demands. Consequently, across all locations, community members report that child marriage is no longer practiced. The program has been able to increase the confidence and capacity of collective members (particularly the youth) to spread their knowledge to other members of the community, recognize when rights are being violated and to intervene or raise their voice against them.

Table 5: Project's performance against the impact indicators

	Baseline Secondary Data	Endline Secondary Data	Endline Survey Total
Overall Indicator 1000.1: <i>Proportion of women aged 18 - 49 who experienced violence in past 12 months</i>	24.6% (DHS Value for 15-49 years, 2015/ 16)	Not available	13.0 (n= 201)
Overall Indicator 1000.2: <i>Proportion of women aged 18 - 24 who were married before the age of 18</i>	Not available	27.3% (NFHS, 2016)	13.3 (n=30)
Overall Indicator 1000.3: <i>Proportion of women between 20-24 years who were married before the age of 18 and reported forced marriage</i>	Not available	Not available	6.7 (n=15)

- **Impact at the *Relational Level*:** The collectives formed under the project act as safe spaces for the community to freely share their thoughts, ideas and experiences about sensitive topics, to cement their thoughts on gender and social norms, provided new peers to women and girls, and given them the strength of the group to speak for their rights in their homes or community. The collective has also helped its members to renew their relationships with their families and immediate community, by redefining roles and power-structure, making these relations more gender equitable.
- **Impact at the *community level*:** Although the impact at the individual and relational level have been far more than those at the community level, there have been a number of cases of influencers/ collectives facilitating change in social norms in the community (such as the adoption of nearly 18 resolutions by 18 different panchayats on issues of early marriage and girls' education in the target villages). These cases demonstrate that change in social norms is possible and offer hope and a way forward for other communities. Moreover, the project's strategic engagement of influencers have led to discussions and questioning of social norms in the community, making these issues priority areas in decision making.

Sustainability

The project design incorporated strategies for its sustainability right from the beginning. It not only formed the cross-cutting component across all three pillars of the project, but was also the main driving force of pillar 3 of the project. Some of these strategies are discussed below:

- **Community level sustainability factors:** At the community level, the project's strategy to engage with the youth and with the community influencers was an effective strategy to ensure sustainability of its outcomes. This has helped capacitate and motivate both traditional influencers and the next generation influencers with knowledge, skills and motivation to become custodians of the rights of women and girls in their community.
- **Partner level sustainability factors:** Capacity building of partners formed a core component of the project strategy, and was customized as per the needs of the different partners. This included regular trainings and workshops, and use of innovative tools and guidelines and facilitation of peer learning and ownership between the partners. This will help them carry forward the project objectives and strategies in their future programming as well. However, with the recent changes in the Foreign Contribution Regulation Act (FCRA) of India, the institutional future of these partners is under threat, and thus it is uncertain in what form the strengthened capacities will sustain.
- **Sustainability strategies that have future potential and need strengthening:** Some of the sustainability strategies, however, will need further strengthening. This includes the project's engagement with the service providers which remained weak across different states. The project's advocacy strategy, though comprehensive, was unable to bring any policy change. OIN should thus revisit its advocacy strategy to identify areas of strengthening.

Overall, the project contributed significantly in creating an enabling environment at all the levels for change in social norms and existing policies. The community collectives and stakeholders especially the youth and the community influencers if mentored further can be powerful channel to drive the advocacy initiatives.

Lessons Learned

1. Some of the strategies and tools used by the project were very effective and should be continued, with customization and contextualization. Such as:
 - Formation of collectives and delivery of training with the use of formal curriculum.
 - Use of sensitive engagement strategies with religious influencers and caste leaders
 - Integrating livelihood issues in the project design to enhance the communities' engagement and participation.
 - Use of film appreciation module and interactive community programs (like theatre and rallies) to engage the community
 - Community Score card to generate awareness and increase community ownership
 - Engaging with more than one member from the same family and engaging with young women to change social and gender norms in the family and community
2. Some strategies were found to be challenging to implement; OIN should account for more time, resources, and technical inputs when implementing these:
 - Working with survivors of VAWG as they are thinly spread out
 - Engagement with youth in villages where there is high rate of migration
 - Legal education of women on the issues of VAWG and CEFM
 - Livelihood promotion activities, especially if women and girls
 - Changing deep rooted social norms of the community
 - The project management strategy as the framework underwent considerable change during the project period, and used complex and large number of indicators, making it difficult to assess change.
3. Certain strategies that OIN should consider in its future programs to address VAWG:
 - More intensive engagement with men as they are the key decision makers within the households

- More intensive engagement with the influencers like caste and religious leaders, PRI members and government officials at the local and district levels
- Use of social media to change norms of the community
- Use of sports to engage the youth
- More intense and regular linkages with higher educational institutes to engage more youth on a consistent basis

Recommendations

- The project's theory of change should review inclusion of economic activities for all the targeted women and girls and youth. This will require technical knowledge and accordingly Oxfam and WROs should consider partnering with such specialised organisations.
- The project must continue with the strategies of formation of collectives and their capacity building, and include greater engagement with men and use of household-approach. A model family approach can also be tested, in which the project targets the family as a unit of intervention and change, and facilitates the entire family's progression against the project indicators.
- A more intensive, regular and strategic approach is required to engage with the influencers.
- More intensive resource allocation should be considered for capacity development of government service providers.
- A simple, easy and consistent results framework should be used for the project's M&E plan to capture changes on the major indicators.

Chapter 1: Introduction

Background

Oxfam India (OIN) is a movement of people working to end discrimination and create a free and just society. OIN's work aims to ensure that Adivasis, Dalits, Muslims, and Women & Girls have violence free lives with freedom to speak their mind, equal opportunities to realize their rights, and a discrimination free future. OIN finds lasting solutions to end rising inequalities and exclusion of marginalized communities from getting decent jobs, quality free education and healthcare. The organisation also campaigns with the public to demand policy changes from governments for creating a just and inclusive country as envisioned in the Indian Constitution. Further, the organisation also mobilizes support to save, protect and rebuild lives of the poorest of poor affected by crisis and humanitarian disasters.

Creating Spaces to Take Action on Violence Against Women and Girls Youth in Action (Creating Spaces) is a five-year project (2016-2021), supported by Global Affairs Canada (GAC) and Oxfam Canada. The project takes action to reduce violence against women and girls (VAWG), including child, early and forced marriage (CEFM) in six countries across Asia including India. In India, Creating Spaces is being implemented in five states of Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Odisha and Uttar Pradesh, reaching out to a total of 15,441 people directly and influencing approximately 70,587 people on prevention of violence and the promotion of positive social norms.

About the Final Review

Oxfam Canada in partnership with Oxfam country teams is undertaking final review of the project to provide an independent assessment of the project's achievements, strengths, and weaknesses, from its inception to conclusion. The primary audience of the review is internal, namely: Oxfam, Global Affairs Canada (the donor), and project partners. The review will build on findings from the project's mid-term learning review (MTLR). The review aims to inform Oxfam Canada's future programming on ending VAWG and CEFM well as it's programming in other related thematic areas.

An external international consultant is the final review lead who is being supported by in-country consultants. As in-country consultant, Kaarak lead the quantitative and qualitative data collection in India. In addition, Kaarak also developed this in-country review report for Oxfam India team.

Objectives of the Final Review

The overall objective of the final review is to capture lessons learnt and to build on project's experiences and help Oxfam to understand how decisions made during the project can be used to implement successful VAWG projects in the future.

The specific objectives are to:

- Provide an independent assessment of the project, including strengths and weaknesses.
- Assess how findings and recommendations from the MTLR impacted the program
- Identify discrepancies, if any, between Creating Spaces' initial assumptions and actual occurrences.
- Establish progression on targets (intermediate to immediate and immediate to ultimate).
- Indicate adjustments and changes relevant to potential future projects.
- Capture lessons learned and provide recommendations to enhance EVAWG programming.

Review Framework

The final review designed by the Oxfam consists of five evaluation parameters, i.e. relevance, coherence, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. The review was guided by the evaluation questions against each of these five parameters as presented in the table below:

Table 6: Final Review Framework

Review of Project Design

Relevance

(The extent to which the program is suited to the priorities of the target group and the recipients.)

- How relevant was the ToC to the context in each of the six project countries?
- How relevant is the project for youth and adolescents as compared to adults?
- How relevant were the influencers that were originally selected to be part of the project?

Coherence

(The compatibility of the intervention with other interventions in a country, sector or institution)

- How closely linked were local interventions to the social (including gender), educational, and economic contexts of each country's public, private and non-profit sector?

Review of Project Assumptions

Effectiveness

(The extent to which an activity attains its objectives.)

- Based on data collected from Creating Spaces' Annual Survey, how effective was the project in achieving its intended outcomes? What are the reasons behind the project's achievement (or not) of its outcomes?
- What evidence is there of increased understanding/awareness of women and girls' issues (if at all) as a result of engaging more men and boys?
- How has the project's impact been affected by Covid 19?

Impact

(The totality of effects produced by an intervention.)

- What unintended outcomes (positive and negative) did Creating Spaces have?
- What progress has Creating Spaces made on its ultimate outcome (utilizing indicators in the project Performance Monitoring Framework (PMF))?
- To what extent, and in what ways, have Creating Spaces' efforts increased local partner capacities (if at all)?
- How has the project's impact been affected by the global pandemic (Covid 19)?

Review of Project Sustainability

Sustainability

(Whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after program completion.)

- To what extent has there been policy or programmatic take-up of Creating Spaces' approaches (or elements of) at national or district levels in country?
- To what extent have Creating Spaces training and capacity building efforts been embedded in local partner practices?
- How can Oxfam Canada and its partners sustain change beyond the life of the project?

Methodology

The final review used mixed-method approach using quantitative and qualitative primary data as well as secondary data. The primary data is sourced from the targeted communities as well as key stakeholders of the project.

Sampling and Coverage

Oxfam Canada and Final Review Lead designed the sampling strategy and provided detailed guidelines for the both qualitative and quantitative data collection.

Quantitative

The quantitative study covered two kinds of respondents, i.e. women and girl beneficiaries of the project and the influencers. The planned sample size for quantitative study as provided by Oxfam Canada is as follows:

Table 7: Sampling strategy

Influencers		Women and girls		Total Sample size
Sampling Framework	Sample size	Sampling framework	Sample size	
5047	186	2673	182	368
Assumptions: (95% CI, 10% margin of error, Response distribution 50%, Design Effect; 1.70, Non response Rate-15%)15%)				

Further, as per the OCA guidelines, a two stage sampling process was followed, wherein clusters were selected based on the probability proportional to size (PPS) method. All the five states where the project was executed were sampled for the study within which 26 villages were selected as clusters for next stage of sampling. In each village/cluster, 15 respondents were selected randomly. It is to be noted that different villages were selected for two respondent categories, i.e. influencer and women & girls.

However, the actual sampled covered exceeded the planned one. Due to limited availability of respondents in one cluster in some states, more clusters were covered in some of the states. Overall, 219 influencers from 17 villages/clusters and 217 women and girls from 18 villages/clusters were surveyed in the study. (Please see the table below for details).

Table 8: Samples covered

State	Influencers				Women & Girls	
	Number of villages/clusters	Sample covered	Female	Male	Number of villages/clusters	Sample covered
Bihar	3	31	1	30	4	48
Chhattisgarh	5	57	19	38	4	32
Jharkhand	3	49	22	27	2	35
Odisha	3	32	0	32	6	64
Uttar Pradesh	3	50	26	24	2	38
Total	17	219	68	151	18	217

Qualitative

The research team followed the OCA guidelines for the qualitative sampling as well wherein all the five states/districts where the project was selected for the study. Within each state/district, two clusters/villages were selected to conduct the qualitative data collection. These clusters were different from the ones selected under the quantitative study. The cluster selection was done to ensure the coverage of different aspects of the programme and the Oxfam partners were consulted in this cluster selection process.

In each of the states/districts, following qualitative data collection was undertaken. Once again, these numbers were as per the OCA guidelines.

Table 9: Qualitative data coverage

Qualitative data collection methodology	Number in each state/district	Total in the study
FGD with women	2	10
FGD with men	1	5
FGD with youth/adolescent	1	5
KII with Oxfam partner	1	5

Methodological Steps

Translation of tools

Based on the tools finalized by the OCA and the international evaluation consultant, Kaarak translated both the tools, i.e. influencer survey and women & girls survey. The tool were further back-translated into English as a quality assurance measure. The qualitative tools did not require translation as the senior researchers engaged in the qualitative data collection were well-versed with both English as well as Hindi. The translated tools were also made part of the Survey CTO with OCA's support.

Eligibility criteria used while recruiting field investigators

- ▶ Minimum qualification up-to higher secondary.
- ▶ Person belonged to the local area and was well familiar with the survey location.
- ▶ Well versed with the local language
- ▶ Minimum three years of experience in conducted household surveys and familiarity with the subject matter

Selection & Training of Field investigators

As per the sampling plan above, state-wise teams were formed except for Bihar and Jharkhand where the same team covered both the states. This was done due to similarities in the context, language and to drive efficiency. Kaarak hired experienced investigators who were familiar with the locations in terms of geographical location, language, local culture and tradition. Each of the team was headed by experienced supervisor.

Before data collection commenced, a three -day training programme was conducted. On the third day, the enumerators were taken on the field for practice and assessed on their ability to conduct the survey. Kaarak research developed a training agenda for this training programme, which was shared with Oxfam. The training programme focused on the background of the study, survey tool, do's and don'ts, research ethics, use of survey CTO, principles of feminist evaluation and reporting.

Considering the gender ratio of the sample, investigators were selected in the ratio of female:male 2:1.

Data Collection Team Structure and Plan

As mentioned earlier, 4 state level data collection teams were formed for quantitative data collection in which there were two/three investigators and one supervisor. The entire data collection team was led by one data collection coordinator. The qualitative data collection was conducted by a two-membered team of a senior researcher and an associated.

Reporting and coordination

Based on the sample size and the sampled clusters, the research team at the central level randomly selected the respondents and assigned unique respondent IDs to each of the respondents. In cases of unavailability, the central team on a real time basis provided replacements. During the entire data collection exercise, the local Oxfam partners were coordinated with for the logistical support. As the survey on conducted on the Survey CTO, OCA and international evaluation consultant provided real time feedback. Based on the comments and feedback, the corrective measures were taken to improve the data collection quality. Further, the qualitative research team led by senior researchers also supervised the survey teams during their visits.

Data cleaning and transcription

Post data collection; the research team cleaned the quantitative dataset as per the OCA guidelines. Further the responses to open ended questions were translated and coded. The cleaned data file was submitted to OCA for further analysis.

The qualitative data was transcribed as per the OCA guidelines and is being shared with this note.

Limitations

1. The data collection took place in the month of February 2021. This was a post COVID lockdown scenario where in the men in the community had migrated to cities. Women and young boys were engaged in small jobs and labour works in and nearby villages. Due to this the team faced the following challenges during data collection.
 - The team could not conduct qualitative interviews with men's group in Odisha.
2. Bihar and Odisha had rolled out its state board examinations for 12 and beyond in Feb 2021. Due to which FGDs could be conducted with very small group of boys and girls in Odisha and Bihar respectively.
3. Difficulty in assessing variance or change from baseline/ target- For many of the indicators, the baseline data is either not available or it is unclear how the data was collected/ calculated. Similarly, for mid-term review, data for many of the indicators is either not comparable or detailed calculations are not documented. As a result, it was not possible to assess the change or variance from the baseline or mid-term values. In addition, it was also difficult to assess variance from project target; since in many cases, the targets are presented as a percent increase when there is no viable baseline or mid-term data to calculate this increase from. Throughout this report, the research team has provided the baseline and

mid-term data where available, and marked the ones that are not comparable- it is up to the reader's discretion to use these data with caution when comparing with the endline data collected.

Chapter 2: About the Creating Spaces Project

Indian constitution guarantees women equal status, however, the reality on ground presents a very grim picture. Several indicators related to women rights suggest that a lot of work is required to fulfil the constitutional guarantee that women are entitled to. India has a negative sex ratio especially in some of the northern states, low female literacy rate, low female labour participation, and very low proportion of women attaining higher education. Further, practices like child marriages, dowry system, normalised domestic violence all aggravate women's conditions especially in the low income families.

Creating Spaces targeted this issue with the overall objective of reducing VAWG and CEFM through three pathways or pillars, i.e. engagement with key community actors to support and promote positive gender norms, supporting women and girls who have experienced violence and building knowledge and capacity of the institutions and alliances.

As already mentioned, in India the project worked in five states in partnership with one civil society organisation in each state, i.e.:

- Bihar: Sakshree Mahila Vikas Sansthan
- Chhattisgarh: Nivedita Foundation
- Jharkhand: Lok Swar
- Odisha: National Alliance Of Women (NAWO)
- Uttar Pradesh: Astitwa Samajik Sansthan

Coverage

The project reached out to a total of 15,441 people directly and influenced approximately 70,587 people. The following table mentions the implementation and reach of the project:

Table 10: Project coverage

States	Districts	Blocks	Villages	Women	Adolescent boys/ girls groups	Youth groups
Bihar	Siwan	Basantpur	20	500	800	400
Jharkhand	Khunti	Khunti	20	500	800	400
Chhattisgarh	Jangir Champa	Dabhra	20	500	800	400
Uttar Pradesh	Muzaffarnagar	Purkazi	20	500	800	400
Odisha	Kalahandi	M.Rampur Block	20	500	800	400
5	5	5	100	2500	4000	2000

Source: Terms of Reference

Project Design

The project design aimed to create awareness on legal provisions related to VAWG and CEFM and advocate with the government for their effective implementation. At the community level, the project worked with influencers, such as village elders, faith leaders, government officials, academics, and members of the media and youth to bring about positive changes to the social norms. It also mobilised communities to able to prevent

violence, especially through men, boys, women and girls through the changed norms. The project further built the capacities of women and girls to understand their rights and change social norms to end VAWG and CEFM. The project further worked to building alliances to create an enabling environment and share knowledge around successful strategies to end VAWG and CEFM. The table below presents the project design in brief:

Reduce violence against women and girls and child, early and forced marriage in Bangladesh, India, Indonesia, Nepal, Pakistan and Philippines		
PILLAR ONE: Engaging key community actors to support and promote positive gender norms	PILLAR TWO: Supporting women and girls who have experienced violence	PILLAR THREE: Building knowledge and capacity of institutions and alliances to influence change
Intermediate Outcomes		
Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector and political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights, and in reducing violence against women and girls	Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and child, early and forced marriage	Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems to end violence against women and girls
Immediate Outcomes		
(1110): Increased knowledge, skills and capacity of Influencers to enact and implement laws, policies and accountability mechanisms to reduce VAWG and the prevalence of CEFM	(1210): Increased ability of women and girls who have experienced VAWG and CEFM to access quality shelters, legal and psycho-social support services	(1310): Improved VAWG and CEFM prevention and response knowledge generation, learning and dissemination
(1120): Improved positive attitudes and behaviour modelled by Influencers and Youth in support of social norms to prevent VAWG and CEFM	(1220): Increased economic skills and knowledge among women and girls who have experience violence	(1320): Improved country and regional linkages, alliances and relationships on issues of VAWG and CEFM
(1130) Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM		(1330): Increased capacity of partner CSOs and WROs to deliver effective, transparent and accountable programs that contribute to reducing VAWG and prevalence of CEFM

Figure 1: Creating Spaces Theory of Change

Project Strategies:

The project adopted the following strategies, which is as per the three pillars.

Figure 2: Project Strategies

Pillars	Programme strategies
Pillar 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Awareness raising and positive gender attitudes and behaviours modelling workshops Media, Edutainment and public awareness campaigns Knowledge and skills training on legal frameworks and implementation Women's leadership training. Advocacy, lobbying and political campaigning. Monitoring implementation of formal and informal laws

Pillar 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Connecting those who experience VAWG/CEFM with quality social and legal services • Awareness raising and leadership skills building targeting women and girls who have experienced violence • Training women and girls who have experienced violence in economic and livelihood opportunities • Financial support to services (shelters, counselling/psycho-social support, legal aid) • Building capacity of key service providers to deliver quality social and legal services
Pillar 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organizational capacity building (VAWG specific) • Research, including participatory action research • Synthesis and dissemination of knowledge and learning (internal/external digital platforms) • Methodology development of ICTs for real time feedback loops to monitor social services and (formal & informal) policy implementation • Convening and facilitating linkages and alliances

Chapter 3: Key Findings

The key findings of the final review is presented in this section and is organised as per the evaluation criteria, i.e. relevance, coherence, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. As mentioned in the methodology section, the key findings are drawn from primary study and the secondary documents. The findings also build upon the lessons from MTLR.

Relevance

Creating Spaces' ToC to reduce VAWG and the prevalence of CEFM takes an integrated and multi-faceted approach to act on multiple levels, i.e. individual, community, institutional and societal. The ToC is based on the 10 Guiding Principles that shape Oxfam's approach to change negative attitudes, social norms and behaviours. The ToC is comprehensive and bases itself on the three pillars, i.e. Prevention, Response and Sustainability.

Relevance to the demographic and social context

India, the second most populous country in the world, has achieved noticeable economic growth in the recent past, however, the same has not resulted to poverty reduction and reduction of inequality. 20 percent of the population still lives below the poverty line and the other major indicators suggest that overall discrimination against women is very high. In fact, in the India World Economic Forum's Global Gender Gap Report 2021, the country slipped by 28 places to rank 140th among 156 countries. The report relates the reduction in the 4.2 percentage points from the previous edition to the decline in the sub-indices of political empowerment, economic participation and opportunity, and health and survival. Significantly, female labour force participation declined from 24.8% to 22.3% and women's estimated earned income is only one-fifth of men's. The sex ratio at birth indicates wide gaps due to gender-based sex-selective practices. The report also notes that more than one in four women has faced intimate violence in her lifetime. Even in education, one third of women are illiterate (34.2%) compared to 17.6% of men.²

Moreover, the five project states are among the eight poorest states in the country scoring low on social and gender equality indicators such as sex ratio, child sex ratio, literacy rate for men and women, percentage in employment, and rate of VAWG and CEFM (please refer to table below). The specific districts where the project is being implemented are predominantly rural and backward even within the context of each state. The project covers marginalised communities and minority groups such as the scheduled castes and scheduled tribe and Muslims. Overall, the ToC is highly relevant to the social and demographic context of India, the selected states and specific districts in particular.

Name of State	Women aged 20-24 yrs married before 18 yrs (%)	Married women who have experienced spousal violence (%)	Female literacy rate (%)	Male literacy rate	Child Sex ratio 2001	Child sex ratio 2011	Female Work Participation rate (2015-16)
Bihar	42.5	43.2	53.3	73.4	942	933	17.8
Chhattisgarh	21.3	36.7	60.6	81.5	975	964	54.2
Jharkhand	37.9	34.0	56.2	78.5	965	943	48.2
Odisha	21.3	35.2	64.3	82.4	953	934	23.7
Uttar Pradesh	21.1	36.7	59.3	79.2	916	899	12.0

² http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GGGR_2021.pdf

India	26.8 ³	28.8 ⁴	65.46	82.14	927	914	25.8 ⁵
-------	-------------------	-------------------	-------	-------	-----	-----	-------------------

Source: Census 2011

Relevance to the context of VAWG and CEFM in India and the project areas

The national and state level data indicates high prevalence of both VAWG and CEFM. The detailed literature review conducted by the project during the baseline study cites a number of research studies which indicate an increasing trend of crime against women. The baseline study further found that domestic violence (more specifically intimate partner violence) was the most common form of violence perpetrated against women in the project areas.

Further, the study also noted that under-reporting is one of the major issues in data related to VAWG and CEFM as only the worst cases were only reported.

According to the baseline study, there was a lack of systematic data on VAWG overall in India and insufficient data on the specific states where Creating Spaces will be implemented. Some of the key data that illustrates VAWG and CEFM situation in country are:

- Domestic violence accounts for around 38 per cent of the reported cases of VAWG, followed by molestation, kidnapping and rape.
- As per National Crime Records Bureau 2016 data, there was 2.9 percent increase in crimes against women from the previous year. The majority of cases under crimes against women were reported as ‘Cruelty by Husband or His Relatives’, which stood at 32.6percent.
- India has the highest number of adolescent and child brides in the world, with 47 per cent of girls married before their 18th birthday and 18 per cent married by the age of 15 (UNICEF, State of World’s Children report 2016).
- According to UNICEF, nearly 13 percent of married girls between 15-19 years of age experienced sexual violence by their husbands compared with 10 percent of women experiencing such violence between the age group of 30-39.

According to the baseline survey, some of the relevant data that highlights the relevance of the project in the targeted areas are as follows:

- The average age at first marriage was 20.7 for male respondents and 18.2 for female respondents. Among female respondents, only those from Muzaffarnagar (Uttar Pradesh) were married after the age of 18 years (18.9 years). The female respondents from Kalahandi (Odisha) had the lowest average age at first marriage (16.9 years).
- For both male and female respondents, their parents had mostly arranged marriages. Forty-six percent of the female respondents had stated that the issue of their marriage had not been discussed with them nor had they given consent and they were informed shortly before the marriage took place. In comparison, this was for only eight percent of the male respondents.
- With regard to VAWG, 59 percent of the male respondents stated that they had “yelled, cursed and insulted” their wives. 40 percent reported that they had “slapped” their wives. Ten percent had “thrown something, pushed shoved, grabbed or twisted the arm” of their wives and ten percent had also “knocked on the head, kicked, bitten, pulled the hair or punched” their wives. Three percent of male respondents stated that they had “forced their spouse to have sex even when she did not want to”. Two percent of male respondents stated that they had “tied up and beaten” their wives. Four percent stated they had “not allowed their spouse to leave the house” and “not allowed their spouse to work or earn a living”. Three percent stated they had “not allowed them to keep the money they had earned”.

³ NFHS 2015-16

⁴ NFHS 4

⁵ <https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1540619>

- When the same was asked to female respondents about the behavior of their spouses, 58 percent reported that their husbands had “yelled, cursed or insulted” and 41 percent reported that their husbands had slapped them. 19 percent of female respondents stated that their husbands had thrown something at them, shoved or pushed them or grabbed and twisted their arm. 13 percent stated that their husbands had knocked on their head, kicked, bitten, pulled their hair or punched them. Five percent stated that their husbands had tied up and beaten them

Relevance to the context of legal and support Services

While India has a plethora of laws related to VAWG and CEFM, several studies confirm significant gaps in their implementation apart from some gaps in the laws itself. The baseline study of the project conducted a detailed review of the laws related to the VAWG and CEFM and the key findings highlight that the project's ToC was highly relevant. The main findings related to laws that were highly relevant are presented below:

- In case of Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act 2005 (PWDVA), ^[1]the focus of the police, protection officers and the service providers is on mediation to maintain the marriage without formally registering the case. Further, there is lack of clarity of the roles and the coordination amongst the key stakeholders. The key stakeholders, i.e. police and protection officers, lack the capacity to deal with these cases.
- Due to gaps in implementation and lack of awareness, the use of services by the women was found to be very low.
- There is always dearth of adequate resources, both financial and human, in the government departments responsible for VAWG.
- One of the key gaps in the Indian law related to intimate partner violence is that the Indian legal framework does not recognize marital rape. This leads to stigma, harassment and apathy from the police and judicial systems and local community dynamics, which deter the victims from filing a complaint.
- There was lack of adequate research, information, monitoring, and sensitizing the public are the biggest challenges in addressing child sexual abuse. There are gaps in the capacities of the key stakeholders to provide comprehensive care and justice to the victims of child sexual abuse.
- Proactive measures by the district authorities to identify and stop child marriages are highly uncommon. Significantly, due to lack of adequate budgetary provisions, the position of Child Protection Officer is handed over as additional charge to the other officials. As a result, very few child marriage cases are actually registered and the conviction and prosecution rates are very low. Further, the study conducted by the project, Mapping and Identifying Gaps in Support Services, Addressing Domestic Violence and Child Marriage: Bihar, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, Odisha and Uttar Pradesh, highlighted the practical difficulty in preventing the child marriages. The study found that there are no guidelines on how to prevent a marriage, difficulty in gathering evidence in order to prosecute, lack of resources and lack of coordination between different departments are key obstacles in prevention of child marriages.

Relevance of the project for youth and adolescents as compared to adults

India has significantly young population where the median age is 24 years as per the 2011 census. However, despite this young population, the society is still in the grip of age-old practices that discriminates women within the households as well as outside. As per project's ToC, the strategy included deep engagement with the youth and adolescents, both males and females, to bring about positive change in the social norms. The findings of the baseline study and primary research conducted as part of the evaluation clearly bring out that there was normalisation of VAWG in the project areas at the time of project initiation. The youths and adolescents had no voice or representation in the community level processes that primarily drive social norms. While there was awareness regarding the VAWG and CEFM amongst the youths and adolescents, they were disorganised and lacked capacity to influence the social norms. Further, there was a complete absence of discourse and a serious commitment at the community, and the systems to address the issues of VAWG and CEFM. The project experience also suggests that older generation lacked motivation and even

denied existence of VAWG and CEFM in the initial phases when the baseline study was conducted. On the other hand, the youth when provided with support showed eagerness and motivation to change the social norms. Overall, the review team considers engagement with youth and adolescents as highly relevant and a powerful approach to create agents of change.

Relevance of engagement with the Influencers

A typical rural community in India looks upon religious, community and political leaders, and government officials with respect and they have the power to influence lives. They are often considered as the custodian of social norms and practices. The project very strategically engaged them as well as youth leaders to model changed behaviour and positively impact the social norms.

The findings of the baseline study suggest that the engagement with the influencers as per the project's ToC was highly relevant and the findings. Some of the key findings of the baseline study with regard to influencers are as follows:

- The knowledge and understanding of the government officials was found to be limited to the legal provisions, institutional mechanisms and government schemes. The government officials detailed understanding of the factors responsible for such practices. Many of the government officials were either unaware of the ground situation or were in denial of the prevalence of VAWG and CEFM.
- At the community level, the influencers believed that the VAWG especially partner level violence was normal and mostly occurred under the influence of alcohol. Most of them denied existence of CEFM. The focus of the community level influencers was mostly on quick resolution of the VAWG cases and viewed them as a typical marriage issue rather than women's rights issue. Overall, they showed minimal interest in and understanding of the issues of VAWG and CEFM. The religious leaders refrained from talking about violence against women, as they believed such issues to be a very intimate part of family life. Overall, there was complete absence of accountability, tracking and follow-up mechanisms of the VAWG and CEFM cases.

Considering the role of influencers in creating a supportive environment to positively impact social norms related to VAWG and CEFM, the project's strategy to engage with influencers was highly relevant.

Coherence

Coherence with the government laws and initiatives

As mentioned in the earlier section, India has a number of laws related to VAWG and CEFM, however, there are major gaps in their implementation. In order to facilitate implementation of laws and deal with the issues of VAWG and CEFM, the national and state governments also has a number of initiatives termed as schemes. The project as part of the baseline study mapped all the relevant laws, schemes and government agencies. The mapping exercise suggests that the project is coherent with the laws and also the government initiatives. Further, the project also used this information to create awareness amongst the project beneficiaries about the laws and the schemes.

Further the project in different states also aligned itself and partnered with the state level initiatives and campaigns concerning VAWG and CEFM. The project also undertook advocacy initiatives, achievements of which are presented in the next section. For e.g. in Bihar the project aligned itself with the state government's campaign to stop dowry system and educate girl child. Similar efforts were made in the other states.

Following are the laws with which the project aligned itself with in all the states:

- Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act 2005 (PWDVA)
- Immoral Traffic Prevention Act, 1956 (ITPA)/ Draft Trafficking of Persons (Prevention, Protection and Rehabilitation) Bill, 2016
- Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act (POCSO Act) 2012
- The Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013
- Prohibition of Child Marriage Act, 2006

At the state level, the project aligned with following institutions, schemes and other initiatives:

- One Stop Center: A central government scheme to cater to the needs of women victims of violence - Chhattisgarh and Odisha.
- State Rural Livelihood Missions: Chhattisgarh, Odisha, Jharkhand, and Bihar
- Beti Bachao Beti Padhao: A national programme to promote girl child education – Uttar Pradesh
- Baatein Aman Ki: A campaign to promote harmony, peace and inclusion - Chhattisgarh
- “Baal Vivah Evam Dahej Mukh Hamara Bihar: a Govt initiated campaign to end dowry system and CEFM in Bihar. Another state programme with which the project aligned was Mukhya Mantri Kanya Utthan Yojna for upliftment of girls.
- Pandit Deen Dayal Grammen Kaushal Yojna: A state government programme for skill development of youth in which the programme linked girls in Bihar. Other skill development programme with which the project aligned itself was ‘Mukhya Mantri Kaushal Yojna’.
- Kissan Samman Nidhi Yojna and Fasal Bima Yojna: In Bihar, the project aligned with schemes for farmers.
- The project also attempted to collaborate with Mahila Samakhyia and Sahyogini in Uttar Pradesh, Center for Women Studies in Chhattisgarh, and also Utkal University in Odisha.
- Indian Institute of Mass Communication (IIMC) in Odisha

Coherence with the not-for-profit and private sector

As part of the mapping exercise in the baseline study and in the initial phases, the project identified the major non-for-project sector actors including civil society organisations (CSO) and their network and their alliances working to reduce VAWG and CEFM. This mapping was done at the national as well as state levels. Further, relevant networks that Oxfam India works with under other themes were also identified. The findings suggest that the project made significant attempts to partner with the state level networks and alliances. The details of such advocacy efforts are presented in the next section. There are no significant private sector initiatives to end VAWG and CEFM and as such no such coherence could be established.

Effectiveness

This section presents the effectiveness of the project, i.e. extent to which the project has achieved its intended objectives. The section also assesses the factors of achievements and shortfalls as well as impact of COVID 19.

As already mentioned, the Creating Spaces project is built on 3 pillars and the findings are presented as per each of the pillars

Pillar 1: Engaging Community actors to support and promote gender norms

Pillar 2: Supporting women and girls who have experienced violence

Pillar 3: Building knowledge and capacity of institutions and alliances

Pillar 1: Engaging community actors to support and promote gender norms

Under Pillar 1, the program sought to create a supportive environment within the community that addresses the root causes of VAWG and helps prevent cases of DV and CEFM.

Strategies

The project was most successful in the execution of its strategies under this pillar. Some of the core strategies adopted under this pillar are discussed below.

- **Developing collectives at the community level:** Four types of collectives were formed at the community level: men’s and women’s groups aged 25 years and above, and boys’ and girls’ group aged 14 years to 25 years. These groups met on a monthly basis and provided a safe space for the members to discuss and question social norms, gender roles and to bring forth issues related to

VAW. Women and girls used this space to share their grievances and find peer support and empathy which boosted their confidence. These collectives were also the delivery points for awareness generation and training using curriculum especially developed by the project. This equipped both males and females with the legal knowledge and social sensitivity to identify and push back against social norms that lead to VAW and CEFM. As a common strategy, the partners approached the family members of the women group members to join the youth and men's groups as well. It was found that in cases where more than one family member was involved in the collectives, the women/ girls were more able to transform their improved knowledge/ awareness into action. This household approach led to more stable groups in the village as the family members were sensitized at the same time and resistance from within the family was reduced.

Migration and the pressure of livelihood activities were challenges that affected the participation of men and boys in the collective. Across all locations, and especially in Odisha, migration affected the regular participation of male youth in the collectives. This meant, that the collectives often changed membership, or the members missed out on some of the key information sessions.

Caste and religious based divides also impacted the participation of the community members in the collectives. While fear of caste-based violence prevented some Dalit families to send their daughters to the meetings in Bihar and UP; the project couldn't involve the Muslim population in the meetings in UP (despite being a priority group) effectively because the religious divide was seen as too large to address by the program. In some states, however, caste societies showed greater sensitivity in understanding the inter-linkage of different kinds of discrimination- for instance, in Odisha and Chhattisgarh, caste societies started inducting women into the committees.

- **Developing formal curriculum for knowledge transfer:** A formal curriculum was developed to organize and guide the sessions with the collectives. Although the partners contextualized it to the specific settings, (emerging) needs and challenges of the respective community, having the curriculum ensured that the sessions did not lose focus around the key issues and project objectives. The curriculum was effective in transferring new knowledge about gender, domestic violence and CEFM.
- **Community Score Cards:** The community score card is an easy to use participatory tool that the collectives used to assess progress on project outcomes and the community's access to public services. It used the consensus method for scoring. The process of scoring was an effective tool to engage the community (including the influencers) in identifying and acknowledging issues related to VAW and CEFM, to monitor their own progress, and to take actions based on the findings from the exercise. The score-card helped in educating and empowering the community with respect to understanding gender norms and advocating against VAW and CEFM, and to move them from a state of denial to acceptance of prevalent negative social norms and further to take specific actions. The presentation of the findings also worked as an advocacy tool at the local level when it was presented to influencers group. The score-card also prompted certain element of competitiveness and inspired many of the collectives to take definitive actions.
- **Use of interactive participatory platforms for awareness generation:** Apart from the group sessions/ meetings, the project also organized various community events like youth festivals, fairs and issue based rallies. These community events were a favourite among youth and adolescents- for many boys and men who were not able to attend meetings regularly (due to migration/ livelihood activities), these events helped in engaging them and keeping them informed about the key issue areas. These events provided the community an opportunity to express themselves, show their talent and commune with other community members. Due to the interactive nature of these events, they were effective strategies to highlight the program's topics, and ensure retention of key information points by the larger community.
- **Identifying and engaging with influencers:** The project systematically engaged with influencers at the community, village, block and district levels through quarterly meetings and other regular interactions. The campaign developed IEC materials for influencers which included community level traditional leaders, elders, religious heads, members of PRI, frontline health workers, officials of relevant departments including police who were approached for sensitization on the campaign issues.

Later these group members were also encouraged to take specific actions against the prevalent negative social norms.

Due to the important formal and informal power wielded by these influencers, engaging them formed a core strategy for the VAWG prevention. The program strategy was effective in changing the perceptions of the influencers and making them acknowledge the prevalence of VAW, DV and CEFM. However, the effectiveness varied across different geographies and types of influencers. Some of them, though supportive of the program, continue to hold on to the traditional gender norms, deny or condone incidences of VAW and CEFM. Many others, on the other hand (such as the front-line workers, PRI members and even caste groups) have made DV and CEFM a part of their discussion points, transferring their knowledge to the community, and intervening in case of any such instance.

The program's engagement with the influencers helped them better understand the nuances of VAW and its prevalence in the community and included them in monitoring the progress made by the community on its eradication. Moreover, the engagement with the influencers eased the efforts of the community collectives, as it offered them access to decision making and problem redressal platforms, and validated their own voice.

- **Engagement with youth:** During the mid-term review, one of the main recommendations was to give more attention to youth engagement, empowering them as leaders in the community. Consequently, many motivated youth were identified as influencers in the community, and provided with ToTs and leadership training to take a more proactive role in the community. This has been extremely effective, as the youth are more receptive to the messaging under the program, more motivated to take action in their homes, neighbourhood and community, and have the energy, inclination, creativity and education to take up the fight against VAW in all its forms beyond the scope and timeline of this project.
- **Film Appreciation Module:** The film appreciation module helped the youth in understanding gender as a concept, the associated negative social norms and the deeply embedded patriarchy in the society as perpetuated by popular cinema. For most of the youths, the course was an eye-opener, which led to greater understanding of gender and the patriarchy in society and including their homes. Youth further understood the deeply ingrained gender negative social norms, which they could not identify earlier and treated them as 'normal'. The module was effective in building new knowledge in the minds of the youth and also encouraging them to take action including critical review of the popular cinema.

Accordingly, the **most successful strategies** under the Pillar one were:

- a) Identifying motivated youth and adolescent boys and girls and training them using the ToTs;
- b) Connective women's and girls' collectives with relevant authorities/ influencers;
- c) Centering leadership and empowerment of women/ girls in all activities;
- d) Contextualizing DV and CEFM within the local contexts and inter-connected issues (such as unemployment or alcoholism).

The **strategies where more work is required** are:

- (a) Addressing deep-rooted gender bias or social norms, particularly of some of the older influencers;
- (b) The intersection of gender with caste and minority issues to reach the most marginalized (such as the Muslim population in Uttar Pradesh).

Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1100

Intermediate Outcome 1100: Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector and political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights and in reducing violence against women and girls.

The Intermediate Outcome 1100 had two indicators:

- 1100.1 Number of public declarations and actions by influencers to end VAWG, and CEFM, and in support of women's rights and leadership
- 1100.2 Perspectives of beneficiaries on VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership

The table below shows that the project achieved its targets under this outcome.

Table 11: Pillar 1 - Intermediate Outcome 1100 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
ITO 1100 Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector and political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights and in reducing violence against women and girls.	1100.1 Number of public declarations and actions by influencers to end VAWG, and CEFM, and in support of women's rights and leadership	0	8	18
	1100.2 Perspectives of beneficiaries on VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership	0.57	0.74	1.58

Effectiveness Snapshot: Project was **effective** in achieving intermediate outcome 1100. It has improved understanding, skills and capacities of influencers, particularly of youth and improved engagement of youth; but for other traditional influencers, engagement was more in terms of support for project, while their engagement in bringing change in the community show mixed findings (with instances of influencers bringing significant change as well as those of influencers denying incidences of gender based discrimination and violence). The influencers demonstrate the capacity and inclination to take action within the community (often through informal channels) against incidences of VAWG.

Public declarations and actions by influencers to end VAWG, and CEFM, and in support of women's rights and leadership

The shifts in perception, engagement and awareness of influencers have led to a total of 18 public actions (exceeding the project target of 15 actions) taken by influencers to end VAWG and CEFM. This is significant and is a clear indication of the effectiveness of the project in creating a supportive environment within the community to prevent VAW. The table below provides the list of public declarations made under the project:

Table 12: Public resolutions and declarations made under the project

SN	Declaration	Year	State
1	Resolution by an advocate to extend legal help in case of CEFM	2017	Uttar Pradesh
2	Resolution by religious leaders not to undertake marriage of girls below 18 years of age	2017	Bihar
3	Gond tribal caste society passed a resolution to increase marriage age of girls to 20 and of boys to 25. The society started issuing marriage certificate and verification of age through Aadhar card	2017	Odisha
4	3 villages resolved to dedicate a part of the Panchayat office premises to house resource centres	2018	Chhattisgarh
5	7 villages resolved to make villages child marriage free	2018	Jharkhand
6	9 villages resolved to prioritize women's issues and address domestic violence and CEFM	2018	Uttar Pradesh
7	Ensure equal wages for equal work for women	2018	Odisha
8	7 influencers in 7 villages signed written pledges to end CEFM in their villages.	2019	Jharkhand
9	PRI representatives of 7 villages passed resolution to conduct special Gram Sabha meeting to address the issue of domestic violence.	2019	Chhattisgarh
10	Resolution to organize a "Kabaddi" competition (a sport normally played only among boys) among adolescent girls	2020	Chhattisgarh
11	The Satnami caste community adopted resolution to ensure elementary education for all girls	2020	Chhattisgarh

12	5 villages committed to providing dedicated office space to develop women's resource centers	2020	Chhattisgarh
13	11 villages jointly adopted a resolution to end physical violence and child marriage in their communities	2020	Chhattisgarh
14	Women collective in one project village resolved to ensure education of their daughters and to ensure their consent for marriage	2021	Odisha
15	One project village adopted resolution to promote girls' education	2021	Jharkhand
16	Patel Samaj adopted resolution to induct women in their decision making bodies.	2021	Chhattisgarh
17	The PRI members assured to include the agenda of ending child marriage in the election manifesto of Panchayat elections	2021	Jharkhand
18	One project village adopted resolution to stop CEFM	2021	Jharkhand

As can be seen from above, most of the public declarations were made in Chhattisgarh (7) and Jharkhand (5), while few were made in other three states, i.e. Odisha (3), Uttar Pradesh (2) and Bihar (1). Most of the resolutions relate to ending CEFM in their villages as initiatives by the influencers. This is significant achievement as otherwise influencers were indifferent to this issue even though the law prohibits child marriages. Other resolutions relate to addressing the issue of domestic violence/VAWG, promoting girl child education, including women in the decision-making process and allocation of resources for women support centers.

As the project was implemented in 100 villages, it is not clear how many villages progressed at this intermediate outcome level. However, as the project had set a target of 15 declarations, the project exceeded its target by facilitating 18 declarations.

Change in perspective of beneficiaries on VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership

The change in perception of the beneficiaries (communities and influencers) was measured using the community perspective index (CPI) score. The CPI consisted of positive and negative statements which were then scored to come up with an cumulative score for each respondent. Overall, a significant progress is seen from the baseline and mid-line, however, due to difference in the number of statements (between the three surveys, i.e. baseline, midline and endline), the findings are not really comparable.

The findings suggest that the community members in Chhattisgarh and Jharkhand scored the highest (>2.1) on the CPI score whereas community members in Bihar and Odisha scored the lowest (< 1.5). Overall, the community members show an overall greater improvement (1.58) than the influencers (1.51). Similarly, the youth score much higher (1.95) than the older adults (above 25 years).

Table 13: CPI Score of women and girls (state wise)

State	Community	Influencer
Bihar	1.340	1.682
Chhattisgarh	2.172	1.640
Jharkhand	2.184	1.195
Odisha	1.179	1.436
Uttar Pradesh	1.469	1.622
Total	1.589	1.512

Table 14: CPI Scores of women and girls (Adults and youth)

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	1.246	2.168	2.109	1.160	1.452	1.490
Youth (18-24)	1.997	2.537	2.317	1.282	1.531	1.957
Females (Total)	1.340	2.172	2.184	1.179	1.469	1.589

Table 15: CPI Scores of Influencers

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Males	1.676	1.432	1.327	1.436	1.869	1.532
Females	1.867	2.055	1.033	0.000	1.394	1.469
Adults (25+)	1.688	1.508	1.165	1.575	1.847	1.530
Youth (18-24)	1.677	1.675	1.217	1.280	1.516	1.503
Total Mean	1.682	1.640	1.195	1.436	1.622	1.512

The improved perspectives of the community members and the influencers include an understanding the both DV and CEFM are punishable by law and are a violation of human rights, understanding the different and subtle forms that DV can take (including sexual, verbal and economic abuse) and breaking the taboo related to topics such as domestic violence, marital rape and CEFM in the public sphere (see table below).

In some cases the change in perception and understanding has led to a change in individual behaviour as well as collective behaviour to resist DV and VAWG at community level. For instance, girls and women in Chhattisgarh and Bihar have started raising their voice in their families as well as their communities; participating in decision making in their homes (such as about education and marriage) and in community development issues. In Jharkhand, there are instances of the youth intervening during instances of child marriage. Some of the girls in Bihar and Jharkhand have also managed to resist early marriage and convince their parents to let them study further.

However overall, the project was *far more successful in bringing change at the individual level than at the collective level*. Across all locations, child marriage is reportedly no longer practiced, though early marriage still continues. Families where the members were part of the CS collectives have become more sensitised on the need for continued education of girls and to seek the consent of both boys and girls for their marriage. This is new development mentioned during focus group discussions across all locations. Many of the members of the girls collectives have raised their voice in their families demanding to study further and not be married young; in some cases, the members of boys' collectives have sought higher education for their sisters or supported their sisters in their demands. More and more girls in the community are vocalizing their wishes, and parents are more receptive to these wishes than before. A notable change cited across all locations is that parents consider their daughters consent before finalising the marriage proposal. Almost 90% of the community members surveyed agreed or strongly agreed to the statement that "girls/women have the right to choose who they marry." This was reflected in the qualitative interactions as well.

"Now we consult girls and boys at the time of their marriage. We start the negotiation only after we have the consent of the girl" - Women's group member, Odisha

"Now parents cannot forcefully marry off their sons and daughters. Children have become aware too. they openly refuse if they do not want to get married". - Women's group member, Bihar

Similarly, there are many instances of boys and men sharing the workload at home, becoming more sensitized on the different subtle forms of violence (including emotional, sexual and financial) and taking action against them. In the survey, more than 90% of the community members agreed or strongly agreed to the statement that, "men engage in household and care work if their wife is working to earn a living."

Though significant, these changes are mainly at an individual or interpersonal level, with the community as a whole still reluctant to recognize VAWG cases in their village or to take any formal action against them.

The table below gives an overview of the perspectives of the communities, as per their response to the various perception related statements used to calculate the CPI score:

Table 16: Women and girls responses to CPI questions

SN		Strongly agree	Agree	Neither disagree nor agree	Disagree	Strongly disagree	No response
<i>Positive statements</i>							
1	Girls/women have the right to continue their education after they are married	68	29	0	1	0	0
2	Girls and women have the right to work	67	32	0	0	0	0
3	Men engage in household and care work if their wife is working to earn a living	58	33	4	4	1	0
4	Women can keep and manage their earnings	60	40	0	0	0	0
5	Girls/women have the right to choose who they marry	60	29	1	5	4	0
6	Boys/men have the right to choose who they marry	61	31	1	4	3	0
7	Wives have the right to refuse sexual intercourse with their husbands without giving any particular reason	30	27	5	17	21	0
8	When a woman is physically assaulted or abused by her husband, she is able to seek support from family/friends or community members or community organizations for help	45	44	3	6	3	0
9	Typically, a family prefers it if a girl child is born	17	46	17	16	5	0
10	Women should be able to visit the doctor on their own if they are unwell	50	44	2	4	0	0
11	Girls/women can go out on their own to meet friends and family without seeking prior permission	30	29	6	20	15	0
12	Girls/women can speak to men who are not their family members or relatives	23	28	9	18	23	0
13	I am willing to support any woman in my community if they want to report a case of violence	51	41	5	2	0	1
<i>Negative statements</i>							
1	It is acceptable for a girl to be married before the legal age of consent in your country	2	6	2	29	62	0
2	It is acceptable for a boy to be married before the legal age of consent in your country	2	2	3	32	61	0
3	It is acceptable for a husband to verbally abuse or scare and intimidate his wife if he is unhappy with her about something	8	9	8	36	39	0
4	It is acceptable for a wife to verbally abuse or scare and intimidate her husband if she is unhappy with him about something	4	9	4	38	45	0
5	It is acceptable for family members to physically abuse boys and girls if they are unhappy with them	1	2	6	46	45	0
6	It is acceptable for a husband to physically abuse his wife such as slapping, beating or hitting with objects if he is unhappy with her	0	2	4	46	48	0
7	Typically, a family prefers it if a boy child is born	57	35	6	1	1	0
8	Women should ask permission for participation in community activities	37	39	2	17	5	0
9	Men are stronger leaders than women	30	24	12	25	9	0

Based on the table and discussion above, the key areas where change in perception has taken place and where still significant change is required is as below:

- **No further change is required (More than 90% women)**
 - o Educational rights of women and girls
 - o Right to work of women
 - o Economic rights, specifically, management of one's own finances
 - o Ability of women to access medical services when they are unwell
 - o Marriage age of girls and boys
 - o Right of boys/men to choose their life partner
 - o Unacceptability of physical abuse of boys and girls by the family members
 - o Unacceptability of physical abuse of wife by husband when he is unhappy
 - o Willingness of women to support other women in cases of violence
- **Significant change has happened (80 – 90% women)**
 - o Role of men in the household work
 - o Right of girls/women to choose their life partner
 - o Ability of women to access support from friends, relatives and others in cases of physical abuse
 - o Unacceptability of wife to physically abuse her husband
- **Significant changes are still required (less than 80% women)**
 - o A woman's right of refusal to sexual intercourse with their husbands without giving any particular reason.
 - o Preference of girl child at the time of birth; A boy child is still preferred
 - o Girl's/women's right to meet any friend or family members without seeking prior permission
 - o Girl's/women's right to interact with men (not relatives or family members)
 - o Unacceptability of verbal abuse by husbands
 - o Women's ability to participate in community level activities without seeking anyone's permission
 - o Leadership abilities of women

Overall, since the project covered a wide range of community members, its impact on their perceptions and actions also varied considerably- not just between states but also within the same state. Generally the adolescent girls and boys and youth were more vocal about existence of DV and CEFM in their community. Many of the older males and influencers on the other hand tended to adhere to gender biased social norms or downplayed instances of DV and CEFM to protect the image of their community.

In most areas, adolescent girls were seen to attend the training sessions more regularly compared to boys, women and young men's groups. As a result, they showed the greater change in perception due to the program.

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1110

Immediate Outcome (1110): Improved knowledge, skills and capacity of influencers

Table 17: Pillar 1 - Immediate Outcome 1110 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO-(1110): Increased knowledge, skills and capacity of Influencers to enact and implement laws, policies and accountability mechanisms to reduce VAWG and the prevalence of CEFM	1110.1 Percentage of influencers reporting improved knowledge and skills to influence laws		83%*	89.0%
	1110.2 Number of formal/informal accountability initiatives strengthened	0	8	15

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

The endline survey shows that 89% of the influencers show an improved knowledge with respect to the legal frameworks related to VAWG and CEFM in India. **The improved knowledge of the influencers was measured in terms of their awareness of legal marriage age of both boys and girls.** The male respondents from Uttar Pradesh and Chhattisgarh show highest knowledge than the other respondents with respect to the legal provisions. Qualitative discussions show that the influencers are now aware that any individual can make a complaint before a Child Marriage Prohibition Officer (CMPO) on the behalf of a survivor (Indicator 1110.1) and that the CMPO is then mandated to intervene and stop the child marriage.

Table 18: Influencers reporting improved knowledge and skills (age, gender)

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Females	0.0	78.9	81.8	0.0	96.2	85.3
Males	86.7	100.0	96.3	71.9	100.0	90.7
Adults (25+)	84.6	91.7	90.5	76.5	100.0	88.6
Youth (18-24)	83.3	93.3	89.3	66.7	97.1	89.3
Total	83.9	93.0	89.8	71.9	98.0	89.0

Many of the youth are displaying improved skills to influence laws (Indicator 1110.1). For example, youth champions under *Bano Nayi Soch* campaign in all the states used social media (WhatsApp and Facebook) to generate conversations on women's rights. They adopted the theme "Love is Always Violence Free" and "No Marriage without Consent". Further, youth champions have made a significant impact by learning about the impact of the care burden and by consequently beginning to share care work.

In addition to showing improved understanding of laws related to VAWG, women leaders (from village councils and women's collectives) were also instrumental in facilitating different social entitlements and citizenship rights for marginalized groups. For example, a PRI member in Bihar ensured provision of safe drinking water in her community. Further, women collective members in Odisha engaged with the block level development authorities and ensured construction of a road to their village. Women PRI members in Chhattisgarh participated in preparation of village development plan which was earlier done by men (Indicator 1110.2).

Some influencers show greater support for the project, but not much change in their actions. In Bihar, partners reported improved support and engagement of the police and the media for the project. Across all locations, many Panchayat members started approaching the collective members to intervene or help in cases of VAWG or CEFM. However, this has not translated into any change in formal service delivery mechanisms in the target areas.

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1120

Immediate Outcome (1120): Improved positive attitudes and behaviour modelled by Influencers and Youth in support of social norms to prevent VAWG

Table 19: Immediate Outcome 1120 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1120): Improved positive attitudes and behaviour modelled by Influencers and Youth in support of social norms to prevent VAWG and CEFM	1120.1 Percentage of influencers reporting improved understanding of the rights and entitlements of girls		72%*	53.9% (all 10 answers correct) 94.5 % (8 or more correct answers)

	1120.2 Percentage of influencers who can identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM		95%*	53.9%
--	--	--	------	-------

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

Influencers' understanding of rights and entitlements of women and girls

The endline survey notes an improvement in the influencers' understanding of the rights and entitlements of women and girls. The table below shows 10 statements that the community members agreed to, reflecting their understanding of the rights of women and girls.

Table 20: Influencer's understanding of rights and entitlement of women and girls

Statements related to rights and entitlements of girls/women	Male	Female	Total
Technical/vocational/university education is sufficient for boys	89.4	94.1	90.9
Technical/vocational/university education is sufficient for girls	90.7	95.6	92.2
A woman should be allowed to earn a living/income	94.7	100.0	96.3
Earning women have the right to choose how to spend their income	98.7	100.0	99.1
A girl has a right to choose when and to whom she should get married	94.0	97.1	95.0
A boy has the right to choose when and to whom he should get married	94.0	97.1	95.0
It is important for women/girls to get permission from their families to get married.	89.4	98.5	92.2
It is important for men/boys to get permission from their families to get married.	90.1	98.5	92.7
A girl/woman or boy/man should do nothing or accept if she is being forced to marry against her will	4.6	1.5	2.8
A wife is not justified to refuse to have sex with her husband under any circumstances.	0.7	1.5	0.9

As seen above, community members (especially the female respondents) show high level of understanding of the rights of women/ girls to (a) access education, (b) to earn a living, (c) to have right to their own finances, (d) to make decisions about their own marriage, (d) to make decisions about their sexual behaviour, even with their husband.

The tables below disaggregates the findings against the five states.

Table 21: Scores on Influencers' understanding of rights and entitlements (state wise)

Country	Only 0-4 Correct Answers	5-7 Correct Answers	8-9 Correct Answers	All 10 Correct Answers	Total
Bihar	3.2	3.2	35.5	58.1	100.0
Chhattisgarh	0.0	1.8	28.1	70.2	100.0
Jharkhand	0.0	2.0	36.7	61.2	100.0
Odisha	0.0	18.8	56.3	25.0	100.0
Uttar Pradesh	0.0	2.0	48.0	50.0	100.0
Total Mean	0.5	4.6	39.7	55.3	100.0

Table 22: Scores on Influencers' understanding of rights and entitlements (8-10 correct answers; age, gender)

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Females	100.0	100.0	100.0	0.0	100.0	100.0
Males	93.4	97.4	96.3	81.3	95.8	92.7
Adults (25+)	100.0	100.0	100.0	76.4	93.8	93.7
Youth (18-24)	88.9	97.8	96.4	86.6	100.0	95.7

Total	93.6	98.3	97.9	81.3	98.0	95.0
-------	------	------	------	------	------	------

The understanding of influencers in Chhattisgarh is found to be highest, followed by those in Jharkhand and Bihar. Similarly, female respondents show a much higher understanding of the rights and entitlements of girls than the male respondents. However, with repeated transfers of the police and government officials, the key service providers related to VAWG continue to show inadequate understanding of all the rights and entitlements.

Influencers who can identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM

A significant positive change was also noted in the percentage of influencers who can identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM (Indicator 1120.2). The respondents were asked various questions that indirectly assessed their understanding of physical, emotional, sexual and financial violence. The table below lists some of these statements that the community members agreed to, and which reflect their understanding of various forms of VAWG/ CEFM.

Table 23: Influencers' responses to statements to identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM

Influencers' who can identify different forms of violence	Male	Female	Total
A woman should be allowed to earn a living/income	94.7	100.0	96.3
It is a crime to force a girl to get married.	96.0	97.1	96.3
It is a crime to force a boy to get married	96.7	97.1	96.8
If a married woman or girl from the community has been raped, she has committed adultery.	35.8	32.4	34.7
If a woman or girl from the community has been raped, it is her fault	6.0	17.6	9.6
A woman will do nothing if she is being forced to have sex with her husband against her will.	8.8	0.0	6.0
Sex workers can also experience rape	58.3	76.5	63.9

The community members in Chhattisgarh and Odisha show a much greater understanding of VAWG and CEFM than in the other states; those in Bihar and Jharkhand were least able to identify the different forms of VAW (see table below).

Table 24: Influencers who can identify different forms of VAWG and CEFM

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Females	0.0	78.9	18.2	0.0	76.9	57.4
Males	33.3	65.8	51.9	65.6	41.7	53.0
Adults (25+)	23.1	75.0	33.3	76.5	68.8	54.4
Youth (18-24)	38.9	68.9	39.3	53.3	55.9	54.3
Total	32.3	70.2	36.7	65.6	60.0	54.3

These findings were corroborated during the qualitative interviews. Both community and influencers across all ages and genders mention their improved understanding on what constitutes as VAWG and the negative implications of CEFM. The respondents highlight their understanding of emotional, sexual and financial violence as forms of VAWG- this has helped many women to identify their experiences as forms of violence and for many men to check their actions as well. Similarly, the community members mentioned the implications of CEFM on the early pregnancy and on the health of the mother and child from such early pregnancies; many of them connected child and maternal mortality and poor health to CEFM.

"Before coming here, I did not know what violence was. I thought only hitting and beating is violence. But I have realised all that I had experienced in the hands of my step mother and my husband was actually violence."- Women's group member, Chhattisgarh

The use of film appreciation module was found to be an effective strategy to question social norms and break the silence around sexuality and consent. In Odisha and UP, project activities converged with an aligned research project on SRHR. This led to breaking the silence on SRHR and an increased knowledge of youth on

choice and consent in intimate relationships as well as the intersection between SRHR and gender-based violence (GBV) (Indicator 1120.1 and 1120.2).

"We are aware and sensitive now... we know that we will not behave with our family members like our fathers"- Men's Group member, Jharkhand

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1130

Immediate Outcome (1130): Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM

Table 25: Immediate Outcome 1130 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1130) Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM	1130.1 Percentage of women and girl leaders reporting improved understanding of VAWG and CEFM, and women's rights and leadership			26.8% (all 9 answers correct) 77.0 % (7 or more correct answers)
	1130.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of women and girl leaders on their capacity to advocate to end VAWG and CEFM			4.17

Understanding of women and girls of VAWG and CEFM, women's rights and leadership

Across all locations, women and girls report having a better understanding on what constitutes as violence and about their rights. This manifests in them having increased confidence and capacity to voice their opinions and concerns and to advance their rights. This is mostly in the form of women and girls seeking their rights within their homes- from girls demanding to continue their education and delaying marriage, to married women threatening their husbands with police action when abused or demanding equal rights within their families. The table lists 9 statements that women/ girls agreed to during the survey, reflecting their understanding of VAWG and CEFM.

Table 26: Responses of women and girls to statements on understanding of VAWG and CEFM

Statements showing women/ girls' understanding of VAWG/ CEFM	Bihar	CHG	Jharkhand	Odisha	UP	Total
The legal age for a girl/woman to get married is 18 years	52.1	50.0	77.1	65.6	81.6	65.0
The legal age for a boy/man to get married is 21 years	31.3	56.3	65.7	43.8	84.2	53.5
it is a crime to force a girl to get married.	93.8	96.9	94.3	100.0	92.1	95.9
It is a crime to force a boy to get married	93.8	96.9	94.3	100.0	94.7	96.3
A husband have the right to force his wife to have sex if she does not want to.	22.9	6.3	2.9	14.1	5.3	11.5
A wife is not justified in refusing to have sex with her husband in any circumstance.	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.6	0.5
A woman can do nothing if she is being forced to have sex with her husband against her will.	8.3	0.0	11.4	6.3	0.0	5.5
If a married woman or girl from the community has been raped, she may have committed adultery.	41.7	15.6	57.1	25.0	0.0	28.1
If a woman or girl from community has been raped, it is her fault	41.7	0.0	45.7	1.6	0.0	17.1

Most of women/girls do not seek or want to seek external help (using legal course), but use this knowledge of their rights and legislatures to demand better treatment or hearing of their wishes in their homes. Many of the women and girls mention that the fear of police and legal recourse itself helps improve the behaviour of their husbands and families towards them. However these are often temporary and surface level changes that do not address deeper issues.

The collectives itself offers the women and girls a safe space to express their concerns and gives them strength through the numbers. Even for those who don't raise their concerns at home, having access to a safe, empathetic and understanding peers within the collective is a source of strength.

The knowledge levels, and consequently the ability to advance their rights, varied considerable between the different states. As the tables below show, knowledge levels were the highest in Uttar Pradesh and lowest in Bihar, and knowledge levels of the youth was considerably higher than the 25 year and older adults.

Table 27: Scores of women and girls on understanding of VAWG and CEFM (state)

Country	Only 0-3 Correct Answers	4-6 Correct Answers	7-8 Correct Answers	All 9 Correct Answers	Total
Bihar	2.1	50.0	33.3	14.6	100.0
Chhattisgarh	0.0	21.9	40.6	37.5	100.0
Jharkhand	0.0	20.0	57.1	22.9	100.0
Odisha	0.0	26.6	59.4	14.1	100.0
Uttar Pradesh	0.0	7.9	31.6	60.5	100.0
Total Mean	0.5	26.7	45.6	27.2	100.0

Table 28: Score of women and girls on understanding of VAWG and CEFM (age)

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	42.9	82.6	68.2	72.2	93.3	70.1
Youth (18-24)	83.4	66.6	100.0	80.0	87.5	84.8
Females (Total)	47.9	78.1	80.0	73.5	92.1	72.8

Perspectives of women and girl leaders on their capacity to advocate to end VAWG and CEFM

When asked about their perceptions of their own capacity to advocate against VAWG and CEFM, most women and girls scored above 4 on a scale of 1 to 5. The young girls (18-24 years) in Uttar Pradesh score lowest in terms of capacities while the 25 years and above women in Jharkhand score the highest. The table below shows the variation of scores across the states and age groups.

Table 29: Self-rating of women and girls on capacity to advocate (scale of 1 – 5)

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	4.80	4.58	4.86	3.55	3.35	4.13
Youth (18-24)	4.69	4.48	4.81	3.73	2.76	4.14
Females (Total)	4.78	4.55	4.84	3.58	3.23	4.13

The score was calculated based on the respondents' response to certain statements on a five point scale. The table below lists these statements and shows variation of response across them. For all the statements on women/girl's self-perceived confidence and capacity levels, more than three-fourth of the respondents agreed or strongly agreed to them. Significantly, almost 80% of the women/ girls said they were confident of their ability to raise the issue of VAW and CEFM in the local community meetings on their own.

Table 30: Women and girls' responses to statements to rate the capacity to advocate

	Strongly agree	Agree	Neither disagree nor agree	Disagree	Strongly disagree	No response
I feel I have enough information on what to do if someone I know has experienced violence	38.7	47.5	7.8	4.6	0.5	0.9
I feel I have enough information on where to report cases of violence in my community	46.1	43.3	6.0	3.2	0.5	0.9
I feel confident enough to raise the issue of violence against women in local community meetings on my own	41.9	36.9	11.1	6.9	0.5	2.8
I feel confident enough only if other women in my community help me to raise the issue of violence against women in local community meetings	44.7	37.3	8.8	6.0	0.5	2.8
I feel I have enough information on what to do if a girl is being forced to marry	43.8	38.2	10.6	3.2	0.0	4.1
I feel confident enough to approach a girl's family on my own if she is being forced to marry	49.3	35.9	7.8	3.7	0.0	3.2
I feel confident only if other women in my community help me to approach a girl's family if she is being forced to marry	49.8	30.0	9.2	8.3	0.0	2.8
I feel confident enough to raise the issue of child and early marriage in local community meetings on my own	41.9	35.5	11.1	7.8	0.9	2.8
I feel confident only if other women in my community help me to speak out against child and early marriage in local community meetings	47.0	31.3	12.9	5.1	0.9	2.8

Many of the women/ girls have translated their confidence into concrete actions at the community levels by intervening during instances of VAWG or CEFM in the community, assisting survivors or sharing information with other girls/ women in the community. In some communities, women and girls have also raised their voice in the Gram Sabhas and village meetings, and used their enhanced confidence and decision making skills to advance the rights of other members of the community. The table below lists the proportion of women/ girl leaders who have been successful in these advocacy efforts. This varies significantly across the different states- in Chhattisgarh, for instance, more than 80% of the women have been successful in at least one advocacy effort, while in Uttar Pradesh, 92% of the women could not cite a single example where they were successful. This is a reflection of both the respondents' own leadership abilities and the receptivity of their communities.

Table 31: Women and girls who provided successful examples of advocacy/interventions

Women who cited examples of they have been successful in advocacy efforts.	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total
Successfully stopped CEFM	2.1	21.9	37.1	4.7	0.0	11.1
Successfully stopped VAWG	10.4	18.8	28.6	1.6	5.3	11.1
In cases of VAWG, have intervened/counselled	6.3	34.4	0.0	4.7	2.6	8.3
Tried to stop child marriages	4.2	25.0	0.0	1.6	0.0	5.1
Others like awareness generation	4.2	25.0	5.7	6.3	0.0	7.4
No example	77.1	18.8	45.7	81.3	92.1	67.3

Pillar 2: Supporting women and girls who have experienced violence

Under Pillar 2, the project sought to provide relief and support to the women and girls facing violence. The project **was comparatively less successful in the execution of its strategies** under this pillar. While it successfully met most of the targets set under this component, the overall effectiveness and impact was limited when compared to the other two pillars. This is mainly due to the absence of quality support services or livelihood opportunities in the target areas, the disruption caused due to COVID-19 related lockdown, lack of adequate funds or time to create sustained linkages for support and relief for the women and girls facing violence. However, the project did create favourable conditions for women and girls to access income-generation opportunities and support services, in a sustained manner. Although, initially the project had underbudgeted for this component, it subsequently shifting funds to this pillar and increased its scale based on the findings of the mid-term review.

The key strategies adopted under Pillar were:

- **Connecting the survivors of VAW to support services:** In Odisha and Chhattisgarh, women's support centres were created which were instrumental in providing legal support to women survivors of violence. These centres provided socio-psychological counselling to the survivors and linked them to emergency services. In the other three states, the project linked the survivors of VAWG to existing support and emergency services. However, in the absence of enough quality support services in the targeted locations, the project was unable to create any meaningful linkages in these states. While some of the beneficiaries did benefit from the project, these were adhoc cases and do not reflect overall effectiveness of project in these three states (Bihar, U.P. and Jharkhand).
- **Building capacity of support Service Providers on their role to implement different violence services:** The project also undertook training workshops with all the relevant VAWG support service providers such as the protection officers, child marriage prohibition officers, AWW, ASHA and stakeholders from the health systems. These were effective in orienting the service providers on their roles (which the project found was missing), sensitizing them on addressing VAWG using a feminist lens, building clarity of PWDVA Act, and preparing the ground for better coordination between the different service providers.
- **Training and connecting the survivors to livelihood opportunities:** The project provided information to women on different income generating activities. These ranged from poultry, piggyery, horticulture and kitchen gardening and small business opportunities. In some cases women and women groups were linked with regional specific livelihood initiatives of the government. These initiatives have triggered hope and confidence among women. They saw this as an opportunity to enhance their value and respect and a gateway to economic independence and resist and address violence in their lives.

"We do not want to be dependent on our men for our needs. – Women's group member, Chhattisgarh"

However, these efforts have not translated into economic empowerment for the woman. This is due to a combination of factors: (a) unforeseen external challenges like the pandemic and flood in Bihar; (b) type of training or linkages provided which did not take account of the needs/ resources of the women- for instance, most of the trainings were related to development of micro-businesses but the women lacked funds to start a business; (c) livelihood trainings were not always combined with CS trainings, and thus even when women did start making more money, their access to that money or decision making related to that money continued to be limited.

- **Building capacity of community influencers to understand women's economic rights:** The project organized workshops with community level influencers (including the youth influencers) to increase their sensitivity to women's economic rights, unequal distribution of work burden between men and women, and on linkages with livelihood options. This has helped create a more favorable

environment for the women in the community, where these influencers now advocate for equal wages for equal work for women, help them access government livelihood schemes and opportunities, and link them to economic benefits.

Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1200

Intermediate Outcome 1200: Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and child, early and forced marriage

The immediate outcome had three indicators:

- Percentage of women and girls who have experienced violence accessing quality support services
- Percentage of women and girls reporting satisfaction with the quality of support services
- Percentage of women and girls accessing economic opportunities

Table 32: Pillar 2 - Intermediate Outcome 1200 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
ITO 1200 Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and child, early and forced marriage	1200.1 Percentage of women and girls who have experienced violence accessing quality support services ⁶ , by country	14%*	40%	53.8%
	1200.2 Percentage of women and girls reporting satisfaction with the quality of support services	32%*	100%*	85.7%
	1200.3 Percentage of women and girls accessing economic opportunities	3%*	16%*	25.8%

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

Effectiveness Snapshot: Moderately effective. While the project has made some progress in this regard, it has not been able to connect the survivors of GBV to sustainable sources of income or support services. The impact of the project has been on a case by case basis, and not in terms of creating sustainable linkages for women and girls to access economic empowerment or support when facing violence. The project has, however, created favourable conditions for the women (better sensitised, trained and supportive community and service providers) to access improved support services and income generation opportunities in the future.

Women and girls' access to support services

Only a little over half of the women and girls experiencing violence report accessing quality support services. This is due to the absence of enough quality services in the vicinity, and the project did not have the funds or scope to create such services. In all locations, the project mapped the existing service providers and provided them with training; but due to repeated transfers of the staff and lack of coordination between them, these did not always translate into enhanced capacity of the service providers.

Table 33: Percentage of women and girls (survivors of violence) who accessed quality support services

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	0.0	0.0	0.0	80.0	33.3	52.9

⁶ The definition of quality support services was never provided; thus, these may have been more limited at baseline.

Youth (18-24)	100.0	33.3	0.0	100.0	100.0	55.6
Females (Total)	50.0	20.0	0.0	81.8	60.0	53.8

Overall, women and girls in Odisha report highest access to quality support services. This is both due to the presence of more numbers of government support provisions, and due to the women's support centre run by the partner there.

Women and girls reporting satisfaction with the quality of support services

Most women accessing support services expressed their satisfaction with them. In Bihar, Chhattisgarh and Odisha, all the women report satisfaction with the service received – note that only one woman was able to access services in Bihar and Chhattisgarh each. In Uttar Pradesh, however, only one out of the three women that were referred to the support services, expressed satisfaction with them.

Table 34: Survivors of violence who reported satisfaction with the quality of services

Country	Endline Result
Bihar (n=1)	100.0
Chhattisgarh (n=1)	100.0
Jharkhand (n=0)	0.0
Odisha (n=9)	100.0
Uttar Pradesh (n=3)	33.3
Total (n=14)	85.7

Women's access to economic opportunities

Many women's group members received information and training on livelihood options. But except for a few cases, this has not translated into viable income-generating options.

In almost all the locations, women's group members mention the need for income-generating activities, or support to improve family income, as most of the family tension stems from this. The access to trainings and information about livelihood options have enhanced their confidence and given them hope but has not translated into any significant impact on their income. More than half of the women and girls report increased skills, knowledge and confidence to participate in economic activities, but only about a quarter of the women and girls have been able to actually access any economic opportunities. These numbers are highest in Chhattisgarh and Jharkhand (where 44% and 46% women accessed economic opportunities respectively) and lowest in Uttar Pradesh (where only 5% were able to access any income generation opportunity). Bihar also performed poorly on access to income opportunities.

Table 35: Women and girls who accessed economic opportunities

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	11.9	52.2	50.0	27.8	3.3	25.7
Youth (18-24)	0.0	22.2	38.5	20.0	12.5	21.7
Females (Total)	10.4	43.8	45.7	26.6	5.3	24.9

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1210

Immediate Outcome (1210): Increased ability of women and girls who have experienced VAWG and CEFM to access quality shelters, legal and psycho-social support services

Table 36: Pillar 2 - Immediate Outcome 1210 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1210): Increased ability of women and girls who have experienced VAWG and CEFM to access quality shelters, legal	1210.1 Percentage of women and girls reached reporting increased awareness of their	No baseline*	77%*	81.8%

and psycho-social support services	rights and ability to access support services			
------------------------------------	---	--	--	--

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

Although their access continue to be limited, women and girls report an increase capacity to access support services across all locations. In Chhattisgarh for instance, 100% of the women and girls report increased ability to access support services, but only 20% of those who have experienced violence in the state report actually accessing quality services. This increased confidence in their ability is due to their increase awareness of rights and knowledge of legal provisions. But in the absence of accessible quality services, most of them use this awareness to informally resolve disputes. Odisha performs the poorest (58%) in awareness of women/ girls on their ability to access services.

Table 37: Percentage of women and girls who reported increased awareness to access support services

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	97.6	100.0	95.5	55.6	70.0	79.5
Youth (18-24)	100.0	100.0	100.0	70.0	50.0	84.8
Females (Total)	97.9	100.0	97.1	57.8	65.8	80.6

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1220

Immediate Outcome (1220): Increased economic skills and knowledge among women and girls who have experience violence

Table 38: Pillar 2 - Immediate Outcome 1220 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1220): Increased economic skills and knowledge among women and girls who have experience violence	1220.1 Percentage of women and girls reporting increased skills, knowledge and confidence to participate in economic activities	No baseline	85%*	56.9%
	1220.2 Percentage of women and girls who report on positive support from family to participate in economic activities	No baseline	94%*	97.9%

**Source/ calculation of data is unknown OR data calculation is not comparable to that used in endline, therefore any variance cannot be calculated. This assessment is as per OCA's international final review consultant.*

Increased skills, knowledge and confidence to participate in economic activities

As mentioned above, although only about 25% of the women report accessing any income generation opportunity, the project has equipped the women/ girls with information and confidence to access such opportunities. 55% of the women - ranging from 94% in Chhattisgarh and none in Uttar Pradesh (see table below) - report increased skills and confidence to participate in economic activities. Similarly, as many as 83% and 71% of the women/ girls in Jharkhand and Bihar (respectively) and only 41% in Odisha report having increased capacity and confidence to participate in economic activities.

During the qualitative interviews, many women expressed confidence to translate their new skills and information into practice once the COVID related lockdown eases.

Table 39: Percentage of women and girls who reported increased skills, knowledge and confidence to participate in economic activities

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	71.4	95.7	77.3	42.6	0.0	53.8
Youth (18-24)	66.7	88.9	92.3	30.0	0.0	58.7
Females (Total)	70.8	93.8	82.9	40.6	0.0	54.8

In addition, women also expressed an enhanced understanding of their economic rights within the family.

Through this programme I came to know about my rights over my fathers property. So last year, I went to my village and talked to the Sarpanch. I gave an application in the Panchayat. After a lot of follow-up, my father's house is now is equally divided among me and my brothers.- Women's group member, Chhattisgarh

Increased support from family to participate in economic activities

Significantly, most women expressed confidence of receiving support from their family to participate in economic activities. Though this varied significantly across states- from only 50% in Uttar Pradesh reporting such support to 100% in Bihar and Odisha (see table below).

Table 40: Percentage of women and girls who reported positive support from the family to participate in economic activities

Country	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total Mean
Adults (25+)	100.0	91.7	100.0	100.0	100.0	97.4
Youth (18-24)	0.0	0.0	80.0	100.0	0.0	55.6
Females (Total)	100.0	78.6	93.8	100.0	50.0	89.6

Pillar 3: Building knowledge and capacity of institutions and alliances to influence change

Under this pillar, the program prioritised building strength and capacity of the partners and their alliances to ensure sustainability of project's outcomes. The program used innovative ways to build accountability and capacity of the partners, use evidence based advocacy and to create and empower alliances to carry forward the work started by this program. Some of the key strategies under this pillar include:

- **Innovative ways to improve accountability, planning and monitoring of project activities:** OIN developed innovative methods and guided the partners on them to help improve their accountability systems, engage in evidence-based planning and better monitor project activities. These not only serve this project, but are processes for sustainability of project's impact that the partners can carry forward in other ongoing or future interventions. The two key methods used under this are:

Table 41: Innovative methods used by the partners

Innovative Methods used by Partners	Brief description
Peer Learning Exercise	<p>The peer learning exercise (PLE) was an innovative method used to conduct mid-term review of the project wherein the partners visited each other's project sites and assessed each other's progress based on a mutually decided evaluation criteria. The OIN staff provided technical assistance and facilitated the entire process.</p> <p>This strategy was effective in increasing ownership of project by the partners and building their capacity to plan and implement a project review (including methodology for data collection, presentation, report writing and scoring), with facilitation from OIN staff. The PLE also provided local partners the opportunity for comparative learning enabling them to reflect on their own achievements and challenges with a new and wider lens.</p>

<p>Capacity Assessment Tool (CAT)</p>	<p>This exercise provided the partners with an opportunity to get feedback about their work from a peer's point of view, instead of an external reviewer's point of view where the relationship is hierarchical rather than equal. Besides that, engaging in critical programme review of another field area has helped many project staff increase their analytical skills and undertake field level monitoring process-learnings which they could then bring back to their own project area.</p> <p>This tool was developed by combining the best practices from Oxfam Canada's organizational CAT and International Center for Research on Women (ICRW)'s VAWG organizational CAT. It guides the project partners in undertaking self-assessment of their capacities at the time of assessment across a range of dimensions including health and social support services, legal aid, advocacy, media and communications, capacity building and training (which includes reflection on social norms), learning and adapting from best practice, alliances, linkages and relationships. This tool formed a key component of Pillar 3, and was useful in improving the capacity of the partners.</p> <p>Assessment allows the identification of areas for capacity improvement, and revisiting the process annually tracks changes in capacity over the life time of the project.</p> <p>OIN facilitated CAT workshops for all the partners to help them focus on their organizational strengths and challenges. The partners used the assessment findings to develop their action plans which specified the actions, its proposed time-frame, and staff/ team responsible for executing it. The partners and OIN then tracked their progress against these action plans.</p>
---------------------------------------	--

- **Formation of Alliances for advocacy:** Formation of state level and technical alliances forms a core component of OIN's strategy in general, and was important for this project as well. This is a useful tool for advocacy, sustainability and scaling of project activities, sharing of learnings across other organizations, and to create strength in numbers when addressing deep rooted social issues like DV and CEFM.
- **Research, Tools and Knowledge Creation:** The project conducted, commissioned or produced various studies, knowledge products and communication documents. These were used to generate evidence, develop and document innovative tools and guidelines and to assess the bottlenecks in operational and social environment for VAWG. These products directly or indirectly serve the Pillars 1 and 2, and help in building the capacities of local leaders, implementing partners, alliance members and other government or civil bodies. Some of the note-worthy documents/ products developed are mentioned in the table below.

Table 42: Knowledge products developed under the project

Research/ Tool/ Knowledge product	Brief description
Study on Implementation of PCMA, 2006	A tool was developed to monitor the implementation of PCMA, which was then used to collect data and to document the findings in a report.
Monitoring tool for PWDV Act	Similar to above mentioned tool for PCMA, a monitoring tool was also developed for the PWDV Act. Oxfam organized capacity building sessions for alliance partners on this tool.
Study titled "Violence against Women and Girls; A Budgetary Review on Women Specific Response Mechanism in the state of Odisha"	A qualitative analysis was undertaken of the state mechanism of violence services in Odisha (in terms of budget allocation and spending). The study assessed 8 specific VAWG programs and legislations, and consequently provided recommendations to improve the efficacy and outreach of these programs.

A study titled “Mapping and Identifying Gaps in Support Services, Addressing Domestic Violence and Child Marriage”	The study identified effective practices and gaps in the implementation of laws and schemes to tackle DV and child marriage in the five target states
Study titled “Impact of Indian Cinema on Young Viewers: Responses to Gender and VAW”	<p>This was an independently commissioned study which aimed to assess: (a) the portrayal of women in mainstream Indian cinema; (b) whether/ how films reinforce gender based stereotypes; (c) role of films in promoting/ normalizing VAWG; (d) how communities consume or are influenced by films.</p> <p>Based on the findings of this study, the report provided key action points to address the issues highlighted: (a) sensitize filmmakers on issues of gender and women’s rights; (b) campaign to encourage female actors to refuse roles which perpetuate gendered norms; (c) feminist rating of films based on a set of criteria; (d) advocate to remove gender biases from film funding systems; (e) sensitize adolescents and young adults in order to view film content more critically.</p> <p>Many of these recommendations were subsequently taken up by the project.</p>
Guideline for gender audit of media houses	The documents captures the guiding questions and indicators by which the media houses can be assessed in terms of integrating gender into their programs and systems as well as in terms of depiction of women and girls.
Media Monitoring Against VAWG	This is an analysis of the representations of women and girls across different media (newspapers, TV news channels and social media platforms) in the month of July, 2017. The analysis focuses on how VAWG is portrayed by these different media sources.
Community Score Card Manual	This manual guides the project partners, community influencers and community members in mapping DV and CEFM in the community. The manual’s purpose is to (a) facilitate the mapping of VAWG in the community, and (b) capacitate the community to collectively stand up against VAWG based on the scores.
Module on Film Appreciation and Women’s Rights	This toolkit serves as a facilitator’s guide to generate discussion on gendered social norms depicted in cinema. It explores mainstream cinema and popular songs in Hindi, Bhojpuri and Oriya. The module include sessions which involve guided self-reflection to help participants connect these social realities depicted in films with their own personal realities.

Progress of Intermediate Outcome 1300

Intermediate Outcome 1300: Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems to end violence against women and girls

This intermediate outcome had two indicators, as presented in the table below:

- Percentage of partners who use best practices to improve linkages to address VAWG and CEFM
- Percentage of partner organizations reporting on improvement on their ICRW/CAT organizational capacity score

Table 43: Pillar 3 - Intermediate Outcome 1300 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
ITO 1300 Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems to end violence against women and girls	1300.1 Percentage of partners who use best practices to improve linkages to address VAWG and CEFM	0		100%
	1300.2 Percentage of partner organizations reporting on improvement on their	0		100%

	ICRW/CAT organizational capacity score			
--	--	--	--	--

Partners using best practices to address VAWG and CEFM

The project capacitated the partners to use innovative and effective ways to address VAWG and CEFM and improve their linkages with each other, alliance members, service providers and community influencers and for their advocacy efforts. For instance:

- The gender audit, infographics and monitoring tools developed to assess the portrayal of gender roles and VAW in the media have been used by the partners in their advocacy with the media as well as to sensitize the youth and the influencers.
- The PLE exercise provided an opportunity for peer-learning between the partners.
- The film-appreciation module and project curricula was useful for engaging with the influencers, especially the youth.
- The community score card helped the partners in ensuring participation and ownership by the community and influencers for the project outcomes.

Partner organizations reporting on improvement on their ICRW/CAT organizational capacity score

All the partners reported improvement on their ICRW/ CAT score over the course of the 5 years. This improvement was facilitated by a series of capacity building initiatives organized by OIN. These were customized based on the need of different partner- the needs were assessed using tools like the CAT and PLE exercise mentioned above.

The CS project equipped the local partners with innovative, effective, and practical tools to better implement and monitor their projects, thus increasing the efficiency and impact of project activities. These tools will serve the partners beyond the duration of these project. During the qualitative discussions, the partners mention the usefulness of the various trainings and workshops organized by OIN. These have been effective in increasing their capacity in terms of (a) deepening their understanding of gender, sexuality and nuances of VAWG; (b) improving their monitoring and reporting capacities; (c) technical and networking capacity for advocacy and alliance building.

Effectiveness Snapshot: *Effective. The project has been able to improve the capacity of the partners and women/ girl leaders to use innovate research-driven tools to address VAWG and CEFM in the target states. It has also strengthened alliances and improved state level linkages to address these issues.*

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1310

Immediate Outcome (1310): Improved VAWG and CEFM prevention and response knowledge generation, learning and dissemination

Table 44: Pillar 3 - Immediate Outcome 1310 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1310): Improved VAWG and CEFM prevention and response knowledge generation, learning and dissemination	1310. 1 Number of initiatives undertaken by beneficiaries using evidence based research	0		8

Using evidence based research

The project capacitated the partners, influencers and the community to undertake evidence based research and planning. Tools like the community score card (for the community and influencers) and the CAT (for the partners) were useful in undertaking evidence based planning. In addition, the project actively used the findings of the studies conducted to inform its activities.

- Findings from the study on the impact of cinema on the Indian youth were used to develop the film appreciation module with the youth, the gender audit and monitoring tools for media.
- Similarly the monitoring tools for the PWDVA and the PCMA were used in the advocacy actions of the alliances in the different states. The process of using these tools also increased the alliance members' understanding of these policies and empowered them to take direct action related to them.
- Partners also developed various research-based products to guide their TOTs, influencer meetings, trainings and workshops. Some examples are:
 - Information on gender studies in the education department, by Sakhiree Mahila Vikas Sansthan
 - Study on "How Jeevika (the livelihood scheme of Bihar) works," by Sakhiree Mahila Vikas Sansthan
 - *Aao Jaane Apne Maa Beneno ka Adhikar* (Lets know the rights of women and girls)- brochure/ pamphlet on laws related to DV and gender, by Lokswar
- Roundtables were repeatedly convened where findings from the different studies were shared at the state levels with SLSA/ DLSA representatives, WCD department officials, protection officers and women's rights activists. A spirit of mutual participation, sharing and accountability was created to develop plans, processes, modules and guidelines centered on data/ research.

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1320

Immediate Outcome (1320): Improved country and regional linkages, alliances and relationships on issues of VAWG and CEFM

Table 45: Pillar 3 - Immediate Outcome 1320 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1320): Improved country and regional linkages, alliances and relationships on issues of VAWG and CEFM	1320.1 Number of strategic alliances formed or strengthened on addressing VAWG and CEFM	0		13
	1320.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of partners and influencers on their engagement with strategic alliances	0		3

Strategic alliances formed or strengthened on addressing VAWG and CEFM

A total of 13 alliances have been formed under this project. The table below lists some of the main alliances formed under this project and their progress with respect to advocacy.

Table 46: CS Project alliances and networks

Alliance formed/ participated in	Brief progress update
Bihar Alliance	OIN and its local partners formed an alliance in Bihar. The alliance sent specific recommendations to the concerned government departments - these included legislative, capacity building and infrastructural recommendations to strengthen the state government's policies on child protection, protection of girls and women from SGBV and CEFM/ DV prevention. The alliance members have since then followed

	up with the concerned departments on the recommendations. OIN has also organised round tables with different stakeholders to take the recommendations forward.
Child marriage core committee, Jharkhand	Charter of demands was prepared and sent to the Departments of Women, Child Development and Social Security. Some of the action plans were prioritised for the upcoming elections. The recommendations mainly focussed on ways to improve the implementation, monitoring and transparency of the child protection policies in the state.
Prevention of Domestic violence core committee, Jharkhand	Similar to above committee, a charter of demands was prepared and sent to the Departments of Women, Child Development and Social Security. Some of the action plans were prioritised for the elections. The recommendations focussed on ways to improve the implementation, monitoring and transparency of PWDVA.
Knowledge Platform, Odisha	This is an advocacy network convened by Odisha State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (OSPCPR). This platform is leading the advocacy for amendments to the Prohibition of Child Marriage Act (PCMA). OIN has been a part of this network and convenes various meetings in it. As a result of this platform's initiative, the WCD department has set up the committee mentioned below to review the state rules for PCMA's amendment
Committee to Review PCMA(Prohibition of Child Marriage Act), Odisha	This committee has been set up with an objective to review the State Rule on PCMA and suggest amendment for effective implementation of the Act. OIN is part of this committee and has been providing technical input to the process. In addition to suggesting amendments to PCMA, the committee also plans to prepare a state action plan to address child marriage.
<i>Sajha Manch</i> , Chattisgarh	<i>Sajha Manch</i> , developed and submitted a charter of demands, led by OIN, to various political parties including Indian National Congress. Most of the prominent national and regional parties included its demand for alcohol ban in their election manifesto. Another noteworthy demand in the charter was to bring in new policies to enable greater rights of women in property holding.

Perspectives of partners and influencers on their engagement with strategic alliances

Although the project made significant progress in alliance creation, partners rated themselves a score of 3 on a five point scale in terms of their engagement with the alliances. This may be because the alliances are led by the OIN, and the partners are not yet that proactive in them.

Progress of Immediate Outcome 1330

Immediate Outcome (1330): Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM

Table 47: Immediate Outcome 1330 - Indicator Table

Outcomes	Indicators	Baseline	Midline	Endline
IMO- (1330): Strengthened skills and capacity of women and girl leaders to advance their rights and contribute to the prevention of VAWG and CEFM	1330.1 Percentage of partner organizations that have adopted the recommended action plan based on their ICRW/CAT	0		100%
	1330.2 Perspectives (on a scale of 1 to 5) of partners on the effectiveness of CAT to improve their VAWG/CEFM related programming	0		4.5

Partners adopting the recommended action plan based on their ICRW/CAT

The CAT tool was extremely helpful in building the capacity of the partners to undertake evidence based planning. All the partners reported using the tool to develop their action plans, and then monitoring their progress on these action plans. The plan guided the activities and decisions of the partners. The tool was useful in increasing partners' accountability, to identify and address areas of weakness, and to priorities actions based on their ability to meet the end goal.

Perspectives of partners on the effectiveness of CAT to improve their VAWG/CEFM related programming

As seen in the table above, *all* the partners used the CAT tool to regularly assess their capacities, develop action plans and then monitor their progress on these action plans. On a scale of 0 to 5, the partners rated the CAT as 4.5 on its effectiveness to improve their VAWG and CEFM related programming. During the qualitative interviews, partners mentioned that the experience of using the tool was both new and useful for them.

COVID Impact

The pandemic and the ensuing lockdown have had significant impact on the progress and effectiveness of the project.

- Increased tension in the households due to financial constraints and overcrowding in the homes (as workplaces and schools were closed). These tensions have led to increase in violence against women and girls, reversing some of the progress made by the project. During the survey, almost half of the community members report an increase in the VAWG since the pandemic- this ranged 72% in Uttar Pradesh to 28% in Odisha reporting such increase.

Table 48: Women and girls' responses on impact of COVID

Impact of COVID on VAWG	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total
Since the pandemic (COVID-19), violence against women and girls has increased	41.9	38.6	46.9	28.1	72.0	47.0
Since the pandemic (COVID-19), violence against women and girls stayed the same	29.0	21.1	30.6	18.8	16.0	22.8
Since the pandemic (COVID-19), violence against women and girls has decreased	25.8	40.4	22.4	53.1	12.0	29.7

- However, the lockdown also meant no access to alcohol. As per the respondents, this lack of access to alcohol curbed many of the instances of household tension or disputes turning ugly or violent. As a result, some of the community members- particularly those in Chhattisgarh (40%) and Odisha (53%), the states that generally experience high alcohol consumption levels- reported a decrease in VAWG since the pandemic.
- With young girls and boys staying at home, there are reports of increasing eve-teasing in the community. However, most community members are reluctant to mention cases of violence/ harassment in the community to protect the image of the community.
- The lockdown and school closure and the resulting increase in household responsibilities and financial constraints have led to many girls dropping out of schools. This puts them at risk of early marriage (if not child marriage). This will once again reverse many of the progress made by the project.
- The regular sessions of the collectives were disrupted or discontinued. However, some of the groups in Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh continued organizing meetings on their own. In some cases, they changed their focus to address COVID related challenges faced by the community- collecting money from well-to-do, distributing ration, helping register migrants, etc. Many of the partners also shifted their focus on providing COVID/ lockdown related relief- this was an effective strategy as it helped

prioritize the most urgent needs of the community and addressed some of the underlying causes of household tension.

But the disruption in project activities and regular meetings may have implications on the effectiveness and impact of the project.

- Proactive measures taken by youth collective members and influencers to facilitate access of community to social entitlements. In all the targeted locations, the project engaged with the influencers to undertake rapid assessment of the gendered impact of COVID. This helped them better understand the needs the women and girls during COVID. As a result, many of the influencers and youth collectives helped the community women and girls access protection services, government relief measures, and livelihood opportunities. The youth collective members were particularly instrumental in ensuring sexual and reproductive rights of women and girls during lockdown; many of them shared the care work burden (which increased during the lockdown) of their mothers and sisters in their own houses as well.

Impact

Impact at the Individual Level

- ***The project significantly impacted the community members' understanding of gender, gender discrimination, DV, CEFM and its links with deep rooted patriarchal systems.*** One of the biggest change brought by the intervention has been in the community understanding the different forms that VAWG can take (i.e., beyond solely physical violence) and understanding the power dynamics and social norms that are the root causes of such violence.
- It is unclear if this increased understanding has translated into reduction of DV or VAWG, but it has given the women and girls to raise their voice against it if it happens. Further, the improved understanding has also helped women and girls recognize when violence is done to them, in contrast to earlier when they normalized certain behaviors. The endline survey shows that 11% women between 18 and 49 years report experiencing violence in the past 12 months. The numbers were highest for the women in Odisha and Chhattisgarh and lowest in Bihar. The higher numbers in Odisha and Chhattisgarh may be because of their increased understanding of what constitutes as violence.

Table 49: Overall Indicator 1000.1: Proportion of women aged 18 - 49 who experienced violence in past 12 months

State	Endline Survey Total	Endline Survey 18 to 24 yrs	Endline Survey 25 to 49 yrs
Bihar (n=48)	4.1	16.7	2.4
Chhattisgarh (n=26)	19.2	33.3	11.8
Jharkhand (n=35)	8.6	15.4	4.5
Odisha (n=55)	20.0	10.0	22.2
Uttar Pradesh (n=37)	13.5	25.0	10.3
Total (n=201)	13.0	19.6	11.0

- Across all locations, the community members report that ***child marriage is no longer practiced***, though this may not be solely attributed to this project. During the endline survey, none of the women between 20 to 24 years in Bihar, Chhattisgarh and Uttar Pradesh report being married before 18; in Odisha however, one third of them report being married before 18 and 13% of them in Jharkhand report the same. Note that both Odisha and Jharkhand have high tribal population where early marriage is more common.

Table 50: Overall Indicator 1000.2 - Proportion of women aged 18 - 24 who were married before the age of 18

State	Endline Survey
Bihar (n=2)	0.0

Chhattisgarh (n=5)	0.0
Jharkhand (n=12)	8.33
Odisha (n=9)	33.3
Uttar Pradesh (n=2)	0.0
Total (n=30)	13.3

Table 51: Overall Indicator 1000.3 - Proportion of women between 20-24 years who were married before the age of 18 and reported forced marriage

State	Endline Survey
Bihar (n=0)	0.0
Chhattisgarh (n=0)	0.0
Jharkhand (n=9)	11.1
Odisha (n=5)	0.0
Uttar Pradesh (n=1)	0.0
Total (n=15)	6.7

- One of the most significant impact of the project has been ***in girls demanding to delay their marriage or to continue their education***. Similarly, parents and community members are showing greater inclination to respect these demands. Even when women collective members don't raise their voice for their own rights, they do so for their daughters' rights. This is a positive trend and may show the way for increased rights for the next generation.
- ***Enhanced confidence and capacity of community (particularly the youth) to act as agents of change in the community***. The program has been able to increase the confidence and capacity of collective members to spread their knowledge to other members of the community, recognize when rights are being violated and to intervene or raise their voice against them. They are no longer just silent spectators of VAWG, and have begun to take proactive measures against them. Sometimes, they have even gone to nearby villages/ communities to address issues of VAWG.

Impact at the Relational Level

- ***Collectives act as safe spaces for the community members*** where they can freely share their thoughts, ideas and experiences about the highly sensitive topics and negative as well as positive social norms. These collectives provided new peers and friends to the community members, provided them a safe space to cement their thoughts, share their concerns and make sense of their experiences, and provided them with the strength to then use to speak for their rights in their homes or community.
- ***The collective members (especially those receiving ToTs) developed new relationships with their families and immediate community to further social norms***. Many collective members used the learnings from the collectives to redefine their relationships, norms and practices in their families and to raise their voice against injustice in their own families. This has meant redefining of roles, work division, decision making and finances in the family.

Table 52: Impact of project on women and girls on their ability to travel alone

	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	Odisha	Uttar Pradesh	Total
I have been able to travel to markets or other spaces on my own without seeking prior permission.	56.3	96.9	80.0	71.9	71.1	73.3

Table 53: Impact of project on women and girls on their decision-making

Who in your household typically makes the decisions about the following

	Myself	Together with Spouse	My Spouse Only	Together w/ another family member	Another family member
When a girl/daughter should get married	0.56	45.81	0.56	49.72	3.35
Making large household purchases	2.23	53.07	1.12	40.78	2.79
Making small household purchases	37.43	53.07	0.00	7.82	1.68
Seeking health care for yourself	53.63	37.99	1.68	5.59	1.12

Impact at the Community Level

- **Strategic engagement of influencers have led to discussions and questioning of social norms.** Many of the influencers have taken measures to address gender rights, discrimination and VAWG in the community, made these issues as priority in their decision making, and have helped the collectives in accessing their rights or services.
- **Demonstrating that change in social norms at the community level is possible.** Although the impact at the individual and relational level have been more than those at the community level, there have been cases of influencers/ collectives facilitating change in social norms in the community. For instance, when the Gond caste society in Odisha passed a resolution mandating that girls should complete their intermediate level education or when the village councils in Chhattisgarh passed resolutions against physical violence and child marriage. Cases like these demonstrate that change in social norms is possible and offer hope, possibility and way forward for other communities as well.

Sustainability

The project strategies at the community and partner organisation level considered sustainability issues in the project design itself. Accordingly, the key project strategies of training, capacity building, awareness generation and promotion of role models can have significant impact on the sustainability of the results achieved under the project. Further, the project also worked closely with the local governance and social structure bodies such as the Panchayats and the caste committees to create a gender sensitive and gender responsive system.

Community level sustainability factors

Engagement of young men and adolescents

The strategy to engage young men and adolescent boys as advocates for women's rights was a powerful strategy as they responded positively by internalising the key messages quickly. Owing to their curious nature and energy and zeal to do good, the youth and adolescents have become advocates of self-change and have also become custodians of women and girls rights by challenging the evil social norms. There are several examples of young men and adolescents resisting marriage for education or supporting their wife or sister to pursue higher education and even demonstrating modelled changed behaviour by participating in household chores. At the community level, this group have generated open discussions on taboo subjects like menstrual hygiene, rights of LGBTQ and consent in marriage. This project induced change is likely to continue beyond the life of the project and also has to potential to have ripple effect.

Engagement with community influencers especially religious and caste leaders

The project's strategy of engaging with caste and religious leaders was successful and lead to a number of public declarations. The project was especially successful in cases of child and early marriages and many of the leaders started special measures to ensure that the child marriage and early marriage is abolished. The special measures included age verification of the brides and public declarations and resolutions. Some of the influencers in Odisha and Chhattisgarh took decisions to induct women members as leaders in the caste society committees, which can be considered as a major breakthrough. Women leaders in these societies were also acknowledged for their roles in resolution of VAWG cases. These changes are going to sustain beyond

the project period. Overall, project's strategy to engage with religious and caste leaders can be cited as a key factor to sustain the project's impact in the locations where the project was able to effectively engage with these influencers.

Partner level sustainability factors

Capacity building of partners

The project focussed significantly on capacity building of its partners. Even though the partners had prior experience of working on issues of VAWG and CEFM, the concept of changing social norms was quite new to them. The project intensively engaged with the partners during all phases which helped in augment their technical knowledge and also strengthened their understanding of feminist approaches to project management. Since the partners have strong local presence, it is expected their increased capacities will help in taking forward the objectives of the project after the project period. However, the recent changes in the Foreign Contribution Regulation Act (FCRA) of India is likely to negatively impact the operations of many of the women's rights organisations in absence of foreign funding through organisations like Oxfam. Given that the institutional future of these partners is under threat, it is quite uncertain how the strengthened institutional capacities will sustain. The leaders and other members of these organisations, however, will continue to take forward the objectives of the project.

Sustainability strategies that have future potential and need strengthening

Engagement with the service providers and strengthening the system

The project had limited reach and engagement with the block and district level service providers from the government. This was due to absence of staff and partner's capacity for this and also due continuous change of personnel in the departments. The project's experience of working with two women resource centres suggests the significant potential the strategy has in strengthening the service providers and their system to deal with the issues of VAWG.

Advocacy and policy change

The project took a number of significant steps in the direction of advocacy for policy change wherein formation of networks and alliances and engagement with the district and state governments were the key ones. The project also built the capacity of the network members on the VAWG issues and the legal systems. However, this so far did not lead to any policy change. While the steps are in the right direction, policy change requires a far more intensive engagement in a long-term manner.

Overall, the project contributed significantly in creating an enabling environment at all the levels for change in social norms and existing policies. The community collectives and stakeholders especially the youth and the community influencers if mentored further can be powerful channel to drive the advocacy initiatives. Women collectives on the other hand though have given change agents, however, more handholding is required to build their leadership.

Chapter 4: Lessons Learned

Some of the key lessons of the project are as follows:

1. Formation of collectives and delivery of training with the use of formal curriculum are effective strategies, however, collectives require close hand-holding support and the formal curriculum require customization and contextualization.
2. Men are key decision makers within the households. The project's experience of working with men shows that men can also be key drivers of change in social norms related to VAWG and CEFM. Accordingly, a more intensive engagement with men, for e.g. fathers, could have increased project's effectiveness.
3. Youths require exposure visits to change their outlook and also to enhance their confidence to end VAWG and CEFM in their villages.
4. Working with survivors was a challenge as the survivors were thinly spread out. As a result, linking survivors with income generating opportunity was also difficult.
5. In areas where youths migrate out of village for economic activities, dropout rates in the meetings are high and this migration is a major challenge. Partners need to develop local strategies to counter this challenge.
6. Legal education of women on the issues of VAWG and CEFM takes time and the complexity of legal affairs is also a major challenge. Projects working on VAWG and CEFM need to simplify the legal provisions and the presentation should be such that it is easier for women to remember the key legal provisions.
7. Influencers like religious and caste leaders can be good champions for large scale change within the communities. The engagement strategy with such influencers should be non-threatening to encourage them to be champions of supporting positive social norms.
8. A more intensive engagement with the influencers like caste and religious leaders, PRI members and government officials at the local and district levels is required to enhance their engagement with the issues of VAWG and CEFM. It was found that without such engagement influencers are indifferent to such issues.
9. Livelihood is the one of the primary concerns of the communities, including women and youth, with which the project worked. Accordingly, integrating livelihood issues in the project design can enhance the communities' engagement and participation.
10. Livelihood promotion requires technical expertise like, establishing market linkages, conducting feasibility studies for activity selection etc, in which the women's right organisations lack adequate capacities. Collaboration and partnership with organisations specializing in livelihood promotion is required for the success of initiatives to enhance economic opportunities for women.
11. Complete reliance on government schemes for economic activities and service provisioning related to VAWG can be a factor for shortfall as the implementation issues severely impact the government schemes' effectiveness.
12. Social media can be an effective tool for norms change at the community as well as advocacy for policy change. The project's experience suggests that partners need more of capacity building in using social media for such purposes.
13. Film Appreciation Module was quite effective in educating youths about the impact of the films on the social norms. Its large-scale application can help in increasing the effectiveness of the project.
14. Use of street theatre, songs, social media campaigns like 16 days of activism is effective in communicating messages at a large scale on the sensitive issues of VAWG and CEFM.
15. Sports can be an effective tool to engage with youth and also to break stereotypes. Alongwith girls, sports is also effective in engaging boys in the programme.

16. Community Score card is an effective tool to generate awareness about the situation of VAWG and CEFM in the village. When implemented in a participatory way, it may not always reflect the actual situation, however, can be a good tool to initiate discussions with the influencers.
17. Service providers at the village, block and district levels require intensive capacity building to develop thorough understanding of the VAWG and CEFM issues. The project experience suggests that many of the government officials were provided with training on VAWG and CEFM for the first time.
18. Lack of adequate support from the service providers like police is a major bottleneck in women raising their voice against VAWG and CEFM.
19. The project could not address some of the practices and beliefs like dowry system, preference of boy child, sexual rights which are linked with deep-rooted mindset at the individual, family and societal levels. The project's theory of change and project's time-frame needs to be reviewed to bring out any significant change to end such practices and beliefs.
20. The project which targets change in social norms takes time and doesn't not have tangible and visible results. Accordingly, the partners find it difficult to assess change as a result of their efforts. Partners require technical support in assessment of behavior change as a result of capacity building activities.
21. More intense and regular linkages with higher educational institutes to engage more youth in the programme on a consistent basis can yield better results.
22. Women can be highly effective change-makers. It is also required to work with multiple women from the same family together, for e.g. bringing mother-in-law and daughter-in-law together on the issue of VAWG and CEFM. Engagement with young women leads to quick change.
23. Use of simple and consistent project management framework is required to effectively assess any change. Under this intervention, the framework underwent considerable change during the course of the project period. In addition, the indicators used were complex and numerous. As a result, measurement of change proved to be a challenge.

Chapter 5: Recommendations

The recommendations made in this section is based on the discussions with the partners, project team and community members. The objective of these recommendations to help improve the programmes which target ending VAWG and CEFM by changing negative social norms.

1. The project's theory of change needs to review inclusion of economic activities for all the targeted women and girls and youth, as that is their primary concern. Engagement of women and youth in the economic activities can enhance receptivity of the programme, however, adequate precautions are also required to maintain the focus on the issues of VAWG and CEFM. Working the livelihood promotion also requires technical knowledge and accordingly Oxfam and WROs may need to partner with such specialised organisations.
2. The project must continue with the strategies of formation of collectives and their capacity building. These strategies need to be further strengthened by including more men as they are key decision makers. Within the current intervention strategy, a household approach can be integrated to include all the members of the household especially men from where the women are already part of the programme. A model family approach can also be tested, in which the project targets the family as a unit of intervention and change, and facilitates the entire family's progression against the project indicators.
3. A more intensive, regular and strategic approach is required to engage with the influencers. Within the overall category of influencers, there are various sub-categories like caste and religious leaders, government officials at the different levels, PRI members, front line workers, natural leaders etc. Accordingly, the strategy to engage with influencers need to be developed as there is a good potential of these influencers leading the change in social norms at the local level. Influencers can also be taken out for exposure visits to see the different models and interact with other successful influencers, which can speed the pace of change as the influencers can make public declarations and resolutions, which are effective in changing the negative social norms.
4. Service providers from the government require significant capacity development and accordingly a more intensive resource allocation in required to effectively work with them. A detailed plan is also required to tackle the challenges of frequent transfers of officials and inadequate infrastructure.
5. The M&E plan of the project underwent significant changes during the course of implementation and accordingly many of the indicators are not comparable to effectively assess the results of the project. It is recommended to a simple and easy to measure results framework, which can capture changes on the major indicators.

Annexure 1: Summary of the Peer Learning Exercise

The peer learning exercise (PLE) exercise was undertaken in 2018. The team members of the five partners mutually agreed on **6 key learning questions** for PLE- two per outcome- which would help to assess the progress in the project's 3 envisaged outcomes areas.

Outcomes	Corresponding Learning Questions
Outcome 1: <i>Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector, political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights and in reducing VAW</i>	Q1 What significant changes have occurred in the lives of women's and girls in the context of leadership and their rights? What are the strategies which worked well and will sustain the efforts made so far? Q2. What are the responses from influencers, stakeholders, community on fighting against VAWG and CEFM? Are they moving towards changing existing negative social norms? Are the efforts visible?
Outcome 2: <i>Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and early and forced child marriage</i>	Q3. What significant changes have happened in the access to the support services to tackle and respond to, and strengthen the women's economic and emotional/social/legal needs? Q4. Has economic empowerment helped the survivors to come out of the vicious circle of violence and abuse? How far has the journey reached?
Outcome 3: <i>Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems by partners and influencers to end violence against women and girls</i>	Q5. What kind of accountability system has been established under the project to involve those who we seek to benefit at every stage and replicate the key learning generated to the other projects/initiative? Q6. What are our initiatives in knowledge and evidence generation? How has it helped us in the achieving the outcomes so far?

The **PLE findings** have been presented against these questions below.

Outcome 1: Strengthened engagement of key religious, community, private sector, political actors and youth in advancing women's leadership, women's rights and in reducing VAW

Question 1. What significant changes have occurred in the lives of women's and girls in the context of leadership and their rights? What are the strategies which worked well and will sustain the efforts made so far?

All the partners reported progress on the following related to violence against women and girls (VAWG) and child and early forced marriage (CEFM):

- Improved understanding that domestic violence (DV) is not "normal" by both men and women community members;
- Expanded and nuanced understanding of DV and VAWG to include sexual, verbal and emotional and economic abuse (along with physical abuse)- for many women, awareness around sexual violence in intimate relationships gave them a radical new way to look at and understand years of normalized oppression within their relationships;
- Increased awareness that CEFM as well as DV are crimes and punishable by Indian law;

- Gradually breaking the taboo related to discussion of topics such as domestic violence, marital rape and CEFM in the public sphere;
- Improved understanding on the consequences of early marriage and the importance of girls' education.
- Women and girl collective members have become more vocal and less hesitant to raise their voice in their families and within the community. They are using community platforms like the gram sabha to raise issues of education, sanitation and women's rights in the community.

Along with the above changes, there were some state specific changes and challenges as well. ***In Bihar***, there is increased awareness about economic rights of women, and awareness about higher education and employment amongst girls. More importance are being given towards girls' education and there is increased participation of women and girls in marriage related decision making in the families. ***In Odisha***, the Gond Samaj, which used to be an all men's group, have launched a campaign for equal participation of female members in the community decision making bodies; with greater participation of women in the Samaj meetings, many positive outcomes have been observed- such as reduced incidence of DV and banning liquor use in operational village (as it is seen to be connected to DV). In ***Uttar Pradesh***, the enthusiasm of the women and girls for the issues discussed is evident in the fact that they have been most consistent in their participation in the sessions than the men; they have also emerged as role models for other community members and taken initiatives to support survivors. There is also a sense of unity and collective spirit amongst the survivors.

In some cases the ***change in perception and understanding has led to a change in individual and collective behavior to resist DV and VAWG***. This is particularly true for ***adolescent boys and girls*** who are able to identify and resist injustice happening to them as well as their peers in the community. For example, tribal girls in ***Chhattisgarh*** have resisted public harassment by local men and threatened to take police action against them. Adolescent girls ***in Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Jharkhand*** have resisted early marriage in their homes and convinced their parents about the importance of continuing their education.

The learning exercise also found that although positive gender norms are being internalized by the community members, these have ***not transformed deeply embedded gender stereotypes***. Notably, several of the PLE missions (Bihar, UP, Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh) observed that preference for a male child over a female child amongst women collective members. Similarly, men and boys in Chhattisgarh still believe that women are responsible for the sex of their child and it is their sins of the past lives which leads to the birth of a girl child.

It was found that the change in awareness and behaviour of the community groups also ***varied based on their socio-economic, religious, ethnic and political context***. This leads to not just inter-state differences, but also intra-state differences. In general, ***adolescent girls and boys*** who are enrolled in education institutions are found to be most vocal about the existence of DV and CEFM in their community, and have come up with ways to tackle it at individual and group level. In most areas, adolescent girls were seen to attend the training sessions more regularly compared to boys, women and young men's groups. In some parts of Bihar and U.P., however, parents don't allow their daughters to attend meetings for fear of harassment by higher caste groups and of them eloping with boys their age. In addition, the partner missions also note that the Muslim population has hardly been involved in the project interventions in U.P. and Bihar (even though they are the most marginalized and vulnerable group in these areas). In all the states, ***migration of youth*** has been a challenge to their attendance and participation in group sessions; this is particularly true with the tribal population.

The learning exercise found that certain **strategies** were particularly successful in changing the leadership and rights context of women and girls. These are:

- Reaching out to more than one family member through the different collectives has helped individuals move more rapidly from change in awareness about VAWG to change in behavior and actions to counter it.
- Overcoming problems of women survivors by addressing them at their own level has proved to be effective.
- Increased awareness of activities related to small scale livelihood activities have increased confidence of women.
- Use of interactive community platforms and bringing greater public attention to issues of women and girls was found to be effective. Such as- workshops, theme-based activities, exposure visit with women & girls leaders, sharing of success stories of survivors of VAWG through audio visual technique and youth festivals.
- Empowerment of youth champions and women leaders are effective strategies for the sustainability of project outcomes.
- Interactive and educative curriculum and use of films was effective in generating interest and garnering attention of the community.
- Identifying and addressing the linkage between school drop-out and early marriage of girls by linking drop-out girls and their parents to schools.
- Use of collectives to increase pressure and raise issues successfully.

Question 2. What are the responses from influencers, stakeholders, community on fighting against VAWG and CEFM? Are they moving towards changing existing negative social norms? Are the efforts visible?

The learning mission noted improvement in perception of influencers, stakeholders and the community around DV and CEFM, but there is still a long way to go with respect to deep-rooted gender norms and the wider issue of VAWG (in its different forms). The PLE missions also seem to have focused more on assessing stakeholders and influencers' perception, behavior and actions regarding DV and CEFM, rather than the broader issue of VAWG. The key findings are mentioned below:

- There are some instances of stakeholders bringing up issues related to the broader theme of VAWG, such as harassment of lower caste women and girls by the upper castes (Uttar Pradesh), trafficking of women and girls (Jharkhand), exploitation of women laborers (U.P.); and even gender-based violence (GBV) in brick kilns (U.P.).
- **In Bihar**, sarpanches have been bringing up issues of DV, child marriage and gender inequality in the Panchayat meetings. Some of the influencers and local leaders are taking steps to stop child marriage in the community; some religious leaders are verifying birth dates of boys and girls before marriage so that child marriages are not encouraged. Adolescent boys' and girls' group members note that although they have the motivation to change prevalent gendered social norms, they don't have the power to do so in their families or the larger community, because of the hierarchical nature of the society.
- **In Jharkhand**, 8 out of 20 influencers (village and panchayat head/ leaders) have declared their villages as no child marriage zone in written affidavit & vowed against any injustice to any women and girls in the coming future.
- **In Odisha**, the Gond tribal community have made written resolutions to address CEFM and ban child marriage. Other caste groups like Gouda and Fisher community are also taking interest in this initiatives.
- Some partners have found a tendency amongst members of male youth groups to display a deep-rooted macho attitude and behavior with respect to DV and VAWG, where they see themselves as 'protectors' of the womenfolk in their family. These men/ boys, while challenging VAWG *outside* their homes,

normalize and even engage in it themselves *inside* their homes; this is due to their belief in their gendered role as “protectors” of women/ girls.

- There is a visibly higher level of awareness and active involvement in those women, men, girls, boys who are participating in Training of Trainers (ToT) sessions on DV and CEFM.
- The older women and men groups have a higher tendency to normalize or rationalize DV and gender inequality than the younger groups.
- PLE missions note less than adequate progress in the capacity of members of the women and youth male groups to effectively address cases of DV and CEFM by utilizing relevant support services and legal procedures. FGDs revealed a less than adequate knowledge of community stakeholders on pertinent legislation to counter DV and child marriage. Moreover, most women and men did not know about the specific support services to access in cases of DV or how to utilize them effectively. FGDs revealed that adolescent girls and even some boys groups were better informed on these subjects than women’s and men’s groups, perhaps revealing a **link between education of participants, the time they have out of household/livelihood activities, and uptake of the CS training curriculum.**
- Some male influencers such as teachers and local and state government functionaries seem to adhere to gender-biased social norms when discussing VAWG and child marriage and addressing cases of DV.
- Influencers seem supportive of the CS objectives but are not playing a significant role in challenging gender inequality or supporting the community groups in their area. Many of them lack understanding of the intersectionality of gender and how it interacts with class, ethnicity, age, religion and caste to fuel VAWG and CEFM.

Strategies that were found to be successful are:

- ***Contextualizing and addressing DV within local issues*** such as unemployment, alcoholism, child trafficking and caste-based discrimination are effective in mobilizing and strengthening engagement of community stakeholders and catalyzing collective actions against recurring VAWG.
- ***Using different communication channels and methods to target specific audiences***, such as community theatre and songs for less educated women and men, social media and sports for more educated young girls and boys, works better to inculcate the CS curriculum on VAWG and CEFM.
- ***Identifying motivated adolescent girls and boys for ToT sessions on DV and CEFM*** was found to be an effective strategy. However, the learning exercise finds that the ToTs should be combined with practical knowledge for the trainees, by taking them on exposure visits to support service providers and training them on procedures for getting help for survivors.
- ***Focusing on women’s empowerment and leadership*** can strengthen collective action of most marginalized groups in demanding their rights.
- ***Linking the CS women and men collectives to government funded livelihood programs*** can be a good way to reach out to the poorest women and men when the training is linked to positive gender and social norms.
- ***Identifying influencers*** that can strengthen gender equality and women’s leadership ***at local, regional and national level*** was found to be very important for achieving the project outcomes.
- ***Adolescent girls and boys*** are found to be important and effective influencers at household and community level.
- ***Engaging men and boys*** in promoting positive gender norms at community level is found to be very important for countering VAWG and CEFM. There are examples of young boys’ and men’s groups members sharing care workload at home. Such members serve as positive role models for other men and boys in their local community.

Areas where partners need further strengthening or rethinking

- There is a need to build the capacity of local partner ***to motivate and activate their group members*** with regard to adopting gender norms and countering VAWG and CEFM in the community.

- Some partners underline the need to ***adapt the CS curriculum*** to make it more relevant for adolescent girls and boys, addressing specific issues that they face, and using communication methods that capture the interest of these groups (for example, social media and sports).
- Partners need support ***in working with hard to reach communities or population groups***. The PLE mission in UP notes that even when working in villages with a majority of Muslims, the local partner has neglected to approach this group in formation of collectives, as the religious divide in this area is perceived as being too difficult to counter within the time span of the project. In Odisha and Jharkhand, the PLE team observed that the local partner's criteria for distinguishing between 'good' and 'challenging' villages was based on the ease of holding meetings and number of people attending the meetings rather than the degree of change in perceptions, behavior and actions of participating members. Similarly, the PLE exercise also indicates that project interventions may ***be missing out the most marginalized women and girls*** in some locations, who experience VAWG and CEFM. For example in Jharkhand although the project specifically targets tribal communities in the state, the members that participated in the FGDs were non tribal groups and not from the poorest groups.
- The partners also need support ***in planning for and mitigating unforeseen challenges and risks*** to their programming. In all the locations, partners have experienced sudden changes in the local environment which has influenced their capacity to progress on project outcomes. Such as the flash floods in Kalahandi (Odisha), presence of rebel political groups in Jharkhand, violence against NGO workers in Jharkhand and caste-based as well as gender-based prejudices and fears in Uttar Pradesh (which impact participation of girls and women).

Challenges faced by the partners

- The contextual diversity between the project areas makes it difficult to replicate good practices from one area to another and even from one village to another.
- Alcoholism of men, bigamy and polygamy, caste-based discrimination and dowry have been identified as the main factors motivating VAWG and DV by local partners and stakeholders in the project areas. However there is a tendency towards quick fix and short-sightedness, where while these social evils are targeted, the deeper seated gender inequality in social norms and structures are ignored by the community groups.

Outcome 2: Greater access to support services and economic opportunities for women and girls affected by violence and early and forced child marriage

Question 3. What significant changes have happened in the access to the support services to tackle and respond to, and strengthen the women's economic and emotional/social/legal needs?

There has been limited progress on linking survivors of VAWG to support services and on addressing their economic, social or legal needs. Some of the key findings around these are:

- There is ***critical lack of support service centres for survivors of DV*** in most of the project areas. Shelter homes are few and far between and Sakhi centres are chronically underfunded, understaffed and poorly equipped to carry out their responsibilities in a satisfactory fashion.
- ***Many potential influencers are not aware of legal provisions to counter DV and CEFM, nor do they know about support services and procedures to address these issues.*** For example, in Chhattisgarh and Odisha, the PLE mission noted that the police staff was not aware of the Protection of Women against Domestic Violence Act (PWDVA), and despite the existence of several parallel structures to address DV most survivors were getting little to no support from them. Survivors are often referred to Family Counseling Centres, where the staff is not trained on feminist counseling and push aggrieved women to reach compromises with little improvement in their situation.

- **There is a lack of information on economic opportunities for survivors of DV, and poor information sharing between different agencies** (government, private-sector, CSO), especially at village level. Identifying sustainable livelihood options for the women's collectives is found to be time consuming by local partners, and they say it diverts them from other interventions of the CS project.
- **In Bihar**, women were linked with the Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana to support them in small scale agricultural activities, and more than 100 women of the community were trained in mushroom farming in coordination with the Agriculture Department. But these are small scale efforts that did not bring any significant change in their income. Only 2% of the women expressed willingness to take up mushroom farming as a business venture. The women community members continue to be economically dependent on the male members of their households.
With respect to social support in Bihar, women are able to access the services under local self-governance (such as the village court). But these services lack transparency and accountability. Access to legal support is also extremely difficult as the women's police station as well as the district legal authority service are more than 40 kilometers from the block.
- **In Chhattisgarh** some of the women's collective members have submitted business plans for funding to the state agricultural department, which have been approved. These women have become role models for inspiring other women and girls to aspire to break out of traditional gender stereotypes regarding women's role in the family and women's work.
- **In Uttar Pradesh**, workshops and interface with various service providers (related to VAWG) helped them better understand their role, increased their understanding about the underlying causes of violence and in preparing an action plan which focused on regular engagement, bridging the gap between survivors & service providers, and swift handling/reporting of cases.
- In both **Odisha and Chhattisgarh**, the partners are operating women support centers for women and girls who have experienced violence. These centers provide legal and psychological counselling, along with linkages to legal services, shelter and livelihood programs. The centers coordinate with existing government service providers to refer the survivors to medical, psychiatric, educational, vocational and legal aid.
- **In Odisha**, youth group members have taken steps towards equal wage for equal work for both male and female agricultural laborers (in Kandegoan and Damkarlakhunta villages).

Best Practices:

- Consultation with collective members on their needs and interests, and linking them to enabling agencies is important in the selection of viable livelihood generation options for the community members. For instance, in Jharkhand consultation with women collective members led to the identification of grass-mat weaving as a viable livelihood option.
- Linking the CS women and men collectives to government funded or other livelihood generation programmes must be done in careful consultation with the stakeholders keeping in mind their immediate needs (skills training, income) as well as more strategic needs (improved bargaining power and status vis-à-vis male members of the family, control over own money).
- When effectively engaged in the CS curriculum as collective members, boys and young men in all the project areas have promoted positive gender norms regarding women's right to education and paid work within their family and the local community.

Challenges faced:

- In some areas community organizations, such as *Khap Panchayat* in UP, play an important role in local governance and settlement of community disputes including cases of VAWG. However these lack critical understanding of gender and empowerment issues, often discriminate against minorities and women and tend to force women survivors into unfair compromises where there is no real relief for them.

- Lack of availability of government and non-government support services along with the illiteracy, deep rooted patriarchal mindset of the community and apathy of government system are the biggest obstacle in accessing support services.
- The project impact is not sustainable wherever it provided livelihood options for women survivors without engaging with the men on positive gender norms.

Question 4. Has economic empowerment helped the survivors to come out of the vicious circle of violence and abuse? How far has the journey reached?

The PLE partner reports observe limited progress in the extent to which livelihood generation interventions have helped survivors come out of the circle of violence. When trying to link poor women to livelihood schemes, such as the Jeevika scheme in Bihar, the partners separated the training curriculum from the CS curriculum, thus only responding to the immediate economic needs of the women and undermining the long term goals of women's empowerment in the process. As a result women in the group said they still faced DV at home and had no decision making power over the money they earned from their work.

Outcome 3: Increased use of innovative knowledge, including best and emerging practice, and accountability systems by partners and influencers to end violence against women and girls

Question 5. What kind of accountability system has been established under the project to involve those who we seek to benefit at every stage and replicate the key learning generated to the other projects/initiative?

The CS project developed specific tools to promote transparency and accountability of key stakeholders involved in the project, to generate learning between them and to build their organisational capacity to address VAWG. These include:

- **The Capacity Assessment Tool for Violence against Women and Girls (CAT4VAWG):** This is a self-assessment tool for partners to assess their capacities and prioritize areas where they want to improve, and develop an action plan. The tool includes assessment items related to the **three program strategies**- (1) community mobilization, (2) support services, and (3) advocacy for addressing VAWG, and **three organizational strategies**- (1) structures and processes for gender justice, (2) partnerships and linkages, and (3) resilience and sustainability.
In 2017, all 5 partners of the CS project participated in a CAT workshop to assess and score their work, capacity and organizational structures and policies to address VAWG. Areas for improvement were prioritized by each partner, who also developed an action plan for the next 6 months and allocated resources needed for carrying them out.
- **The Peer Learning Exercise (PLE)** This is a tool for participatory learning and evaluation where local partners review each other's programs, along with an evaluation team from OIN, comprising staff from the Gender Justice and Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning (MEL) team. The methodology is intended not only to promote transparency and accountability between stakeholders of the project, but also to build learning, trust and cooperation between partners, with a view to build on project interventions in VAWG and CEFM even after project phase out.
- **The Project Monitoring Framework (PMF):** This is an internal tool of the project which keeps track of the progress achieved in the outputs and activities, and immediate and intermediate outcomes of the project.
- **Feedback from Beneficiaries:** This is gathered in two ways.

(1) A **scoring card exercise** with the community stakeholder collectives where the local partner facilitates the group members to rate the changes in their attitude, behavior and actions related to VAWG and CEFM

(2) a **survey** which aims to elicit responses from community stakeholders and influencers in order to document and understand the progress and challenges in achieving the first two project outcomes on (i) awareness raising and community mobilization and (ii) support services related to countering VAWG, DV and CEFM.

- **Community Score Card:** This is a tool for assessing, monitoring, planning and evaluating any service delivery scenario from a community's rights perspective. This community score card is customized for mapping DV and child marriage in the community and assessing the delivery of services by the government functionaries within the purview of the legislations i.e. PWDVA and Child Marriage Prohibition Act. This is a participatory tool to inform the community of their perceptions on gender norms, increase awareness, accountability and transparency between the community members and service providers. This tool has been used by the collective members to rate their community on different indicators. The findings of these consolidated ratings for villages have been shared with the Service Providers to make them accountable to the community and take necessary actions.

Question 6. What are our initiatives in knowledge and evidence generation? How has it helped us in the achieving the outcomes so far?

- The table below lists the **different initiatives taken under the CS project for knowledge and evidence generation.**

No.	Activity	Progress so far
1311	Baseline study/research on current scenario of VAWG and CEFM to enable evidence based program design and implementation	The CS baseline study was undertaken in Year 1, covering the five states in the project. A total of 330 respondents were interviewed as part of the Household Survey and 54 respondents for the Rapid Service Quality Assessment (RSQA)
1312	Research projects to generate evidence on key themes	In Year 2 a study was conducted on the impact of Bollywood films on perpetuating gender stereotypes in rural Indian audiences. The findings of the study were widely disseminated through the Feminism of India website, which ran a 6 week campaign 'Unstereotype Cinema'
1321	Scoping study on existing national/regional networks and alliances working to prevent VAWG	In Year 2 a scoping study on alliance-building studied 7 national level and 4 state level alliances for their way of functioning, benefits of being in alliances, challenges faced etc.
1322	Alliance building/strengthening forums/workshops	In Year 1 two network meetings were organised by OIN to build and strengthen the understanding on domestic violence and CEFM in Chhattisgarh and Bihar. In Year 2 a total of 8 alliance meetings (2 national and 6 regional) were organized in all 5 project states wherein 465 stakeholders s from CSOs, partners, academia, media houses and journalists joined to discuss on the issues of VAWG and CEFM and how it could be taken forward. In UP, new alliance "AGAJ" while in Odisha and Chhattisgarh, the meetings were organized with existing networks NAWO alliance and Sanjha Manch respectively. In Bihar and Jharkhand , a national level media workshop was organized in collaboration with South Asian Women in Media. In all geographies, a core committee was identified which would engage on the issue in a systematic manner.
1323	Regional learning events	This activity is implemented by Oxfam Canada (OCA) every year
1331	Capacity assessment process based on hybrid CAT/ICRW organizational VAWG assessment tool and draft an action plan	In Year 2 five workshops were organized for 5 partners in which totally 73 partner members participated and rated their organisation using the CAT4VAWG tool. The workshops resulted in identifying individual capacity building needs of the partners. Some of the

		identified needs common to partners were: having a workshop on guiding principles on addressing VAWG, building their capacity for individual and group counselling. Some of the partners wanted their advocacy plan to be reviewed. Based on their identified need, a follow-up workshop was organized for each partner.
1332	Financial/technical support to organizational capacity building with partners	<p>In Year 2 follow up capacity building workshops for all 5 partners were facilitated on the following themes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identifying the prospects and access to fundraising for the organization. - Examining the possibilities of advocacy and networking on the issue of VAWG - Understanding power relations and the use of power in our organizations and field. <p>A total of 22 participants including 15 from 5 partners attended the workshops.</p>
1333	Peer-to-peer mentoring and exchanges to support learning and accountability across program stakeholders	In April 2018 a 'Learning, Planning and Sharing' meeting was held with a total of 34 participants including 3 from each partner, and the OIN GJ, MEL and finance team attending. Discussion took place on the main learning from Year 2 of the project for the different partners, the Year 3 proposal and planning of program and finance management.

- The table below briefly lists the main achievements related to advocacy and alliance building in the context of VAWG and CEFM in the CS project

Advocacy activity	Brief progress update
Bihar Alliance Building	OIN and local partners have formed an alliance. They have sent the recommendations to specific departments on ending CEFM. Now the alliance members are following up with various departments. OIN has also organised round tables with different stakeholders to take this forward.
Child marriage core committee-Jharkhand	Charter of demands is sent to different departments. Some of the action plans are prioritised due to elections.
Prevention of Domestic violence - core committee-Jharkhand	Charter of demands is sent to different departments. Some of the action plans are prioritised due to elections.
Knowledge Platform-Odisha	Knowledge platform is an advocacy network convened by Odisha State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (OSCPCR). This platform is leading the advocacy for amendment in PCMA Act or Rule. OIN has been a part and convenes meetings of knowledge platform. As a result of this platform's initiative, the Women and Child Development department has set up the committee mentioned below to review the state Rule for its amendment.
Committee to Review PCMA(Prohibition of Child Marriage Act)- Odisha	OIN is part of the committee. The committee set the goal to reduce child marriage. The Committee has been set up with an objective to review the State Rule on PCMA and suggest amendment for effective implementation of the Act. Being a part of this committee, OIN has been imputing to the process. In addition to the amendment in Rule, the committee will also prepare a state Action Plan to address child marriage.
Sajha Manch- Chattisgarh	<i>Sajha Manch</i> , led by OIN, met various political parties including Indian National Congress and submitted the charter of demands of the alliance. It is noteworthy that most of the prominent national and regional parties included the demand for alcohol ban in their election manifesto.